Early Medieval Catechetic Collections Containing Material from the *Etymologiae* and the Place of Isidore of Seville in Carolingian *Correctio*

Evina Steinová

Abstract

In the last decades, we have seen a growing interest in manuscripts produced for the instruction and use of Carolingian priests. Such manuscripts were identified principally based on their content, as they include expositions of the Creed, the Lord's Prayer and the mass, baptismal instructions, descriptions of clerical grades, and canons relevant to priests. In this paper, I show that material from books VI-VIII of the *Etymologiae* of Isidore of Seville, in particular *De* officiis (Etym. VI 19) and De clericis (Etym. VII 12), is another class of material appearing in Carolingian manuscripts for priests. I identify four Carolingian catechetic collections assembled from excerpts from the Etymologiae and other works of Isidore to serve as instructional manuals for priests. These collections originated in northern France in the last decades of the eighth or the first decades of the ninth centuries and can be connected, like other similar texts, with Carolingian correctio. The two most widely attested of the collections, each surviving in more than ten manuscripts, seem to have been produced in the environs of the Carolingian court. The paper also identifies other Isidorean catechetic collections that survive in a single manuscript and in collections whose intended use by priests cannot be fully substantiated. These compilations of excerpts from the Etymologiae attest to an important shift in the perception of this text under the influence of the reforms, namely its reinvention as a didactic resource, despite the fact that it was not intended for such use by Isidore.

Résumé: Au cours des dernières décennies, nous avons constaté un intérêt croissant pour les manuscrits produits pour l'instruction et l'utilisation des prêtres carolingiens. De tels manuscrits ont été identifiés principalement sur la base de leur contenu, car ils comprennent des expositions du Credo, du Notre Père et de la messe, des instructions de baptême, des descriptions des grades cléricaux et des canons pertinents pour les prêtres. Dans cet article, je montre que le matériel des livres VI-VIII des Etymologiae d'Isidore de Séville, en particulier De officiis (Etym. VI 19) et De clericis (Etym. VII 12), constitue une autre catégorie de matériel apparaissant dans les manuscrits carolingiens destinés aux prêtres. J'identifie quatre collections catéchétiques carolingiennes assemblées à partir d'extraits de l'Etymologiae et d'autres œuvres d'Isidore pour servir de manuels d'instruction pour les prêtres. Ces collections sont nées dans le nord de la France dans les dernières décennies du VIIIe ou les premières décennies du IXe siècle et peuvent être reliées, comme d'autres textes similaires, à la correctio carolingienne. Les deux recueils les plus largement attestés, chacun survivant dans plus de dix manuscrits, semblent avoir été produits dans les environs de la cour carolingienne. L'article identifie également d'autres collections catéchétiques isidoriennes qui ne survivent que dans un seul manuscrit, ainsi que des collections dont l'usage prévu par les prêtres ne peut être pleinement justifié. Ces compilations d'extraits des Etymologiae témoignent d'un changement important dans la perception de ce texte sous l'influence des réformes, à savoir sa réinvention comme ressource didactique, malgré le fait qu'il n'était pas destiné à un tel usage par Isidore.

St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 879 is a remarkable, albeit poorly-studied Carolingian manuscript. With only 44 folia and pages measuring only 195 x 135 mm, it is an example of what may be called a personal handbook, a category of manuscripts that may have been once far more ubiquitous than we realise, but which does not survive well and is therefore quite a rarity in modern collections. We know who produced and owned this particular personal handbook because he left a subscription on the last folio of the manuscript:

Quid me miras, amice, Aurelianus me fecit. Ora pro me, peccatore.

"Do not be surprised, friend, Aurelian made me. Pray for me, a sinner."²

Bernhard Bischoff detected resemblances between this codex and manuscripts hailing from Lyon and dated it to the second quarter of the ninth century,³ which could allow this Aurelian to be identified with a canon from the church of St. Justus in Lyon mentioned in the Reichenau

_

This paper stems from the research conducted in the framework of the project *Innovating Knowledge: Isidore's Etymologiae in the Carolingian Period* funded by the Dutch Research Organization (NWO VENI 275-50-016). The bulk of this research was carried out at the Huygens Institute, an institute of the Dutch Royal Academy of Arts and Sciences (KNAW) in Amsterdam in 2018-2021. I would like to thank Carine van Rhijn, Pierre Chambert-Protat, Warren Pezé, Lukas Dorfbauer, and John Contreni for their useful comments on an earlier draft of this paper. I am also indebted to Sinéad O'Sullivan and Ciaran Arthur for making sure that the English of the paper is in good order. All remaining errors are mine.

On personal notebooks, see Anna Dorofeeva, "What Is a Vademecum? Reflections on Early Medieval Compilation and Intellectual Authority," in *The Art of Compilation: Manuscripts and Networks in the Early Medieval Latin West*, ed. Anna Drofeeva and Michael Kelly, forthcoming. The St. Gall manuscript is digitized at: https://www.e-codices.unifr.ch/en/list/one/csg/0879. I had the opportunity to examine it in person in November 2021.

² The last two lines of the subscription were erased and cannot be read anymore. It is possible that the two lines added in the lower margin of fol. 43v by a twelfth-century hand are a transcription of the erased lines: *In tantum de me rogo: Quid miraris amice?/Funde preces flexus, me fecerat Aurelianus.*

³ See Bernhard Bischoff, *Katalog der festländischen Handschriften des neunten Jahrhunderts (mit Ausnahme der wisigotischen) III: Padua-Zwickau*, ed. Birgit Ebersperger, Veröffentlichungen der Kommission für die Herausgabe der mittelalterlichen Bibliothekskataloge Deutschlands und der Schweiz (Wiesbaden, 2014), n. 5863. Bischoff's leading clue was likely the use of the uncommon blue pigment for *tituli*, the subscription and initials, a feature characteristic of Lyon. I would like to thank Pierre Chambert-Protat for a helpful email exchange about this manuscript's paleographic features.

confraternity book,⁴ and with the future archbishop Aurelian of Lyon (875 - 895).⁵ Indeed, the material properties of the manuscript, such as its size, are consistent with what could be expected of a handbook of a well-positioned cleric.⁶

The personal handbook originally consisted of a selection of excerpts from Isidore's *Etymologies*: ⁷ on weights and measures (*Etym.* XVI 25-26, fols. 1r-5r), laws (*Etym.* V 1-28, fols. 6r-18v), Church offices (*Etym.* VI 19, fols. 18v-22v), the ten names of God (*Etym.* VII 1.3-17, fols. 22v-23v), various protagonists of the Old and the New Testaments (*Etym.* VII 6-10, fols. 23v-39v), and martyrs, priests, monks, and lay believers (*Etym.* VII 11-14, fols. 39v-44r). While technically only a collection of Isidorean excerpts, Aurelian's handbook contains the kind of material that would be relevant for the education and practical use of a Carolingian cleric. The excerpts on Church offices, God, biblical figures, and various members of the Church cover the basic knowledge of baptism, sacraments, the mass, priesthood, the biblical canon, and Christian

⁴ See *Das Verbrüderungsbuch Der Abtei Reichenau*, ed. Johanne Autenrieth, Dieter Geuenich, and Karl Schmid, MGH Libri Mem. N. S. 1 (Hannover, 1979), p. 94, D1. The Reichenau confraternity book is digitized at: https://www.e-codices.unifr.ch/en/list/one/zbz/Ms-Rh-hist0027. Aurelian's name can be seen on fol. 60v (p. 94). He is the only Aurelian recorded in the Lyonese section of the confraternity book, and one of the two Aurelians featuring in the manuscript (the other being a monk in Nonantola).

⁵ On Aurelian of Lyon, see Robert Gerner, *Lyon im Frühmittelalter: Studien zur Geschichte der Stadt, des Erzbistums und der Grafschaft im 9. und 10. Jahrhundert* (Cologne, 1968), pp. 78–94 and 212–13. I would like to thank Pierre Chambert-Protat for guiding me to relevant secondary literature and primary sources concerning this archbishop of Lyon.

⁶ It can be, naturally, only speculated whether Aurelian the scribe is identical with Aurelian the canon and/or Aurelian the archbishop. The chronology of the manuscript, the Reichenau confraternity book, and Aurelian the archbishop's tenure of his see permit it, in particular as far as the manuscript can be considered a personal handbook of a young *scolasticus* in training. As my colleague Pierre Chambert-Protat pointed out to me, there are only three Aurelians recorded in Lyon before the thirteenth century in the *necrologium* of the cathedral, two of them as bishops (including the ninth-century archbishop) and one as a deacon; see Marie Claude Guigue, *Obituaire de l'Église primatiale de Lyon. Texte du manuscrit de la Bibliothèque de l'Université de Bologne, XIIIe siècle* (Lyon - Paris, 1902), pp. 2, 46, and 112. The name Aurelianus does not seem to have been common in the ninth-century as it is absent from the prosopograhic database of the *Making of Charlemagne's Europe* project, at: https://charlemagneseurope.ac.uk/ (accessed on 28/02/2022).

⁷ The three-coordinate system of reference to the book, chapter, and section of the *Etymologiae* used in this paper follows the division of Lindsay's 1911 critical edition of the complete text; W. M. Lindsay, *Etymologiarum sive Originum libri XX*, 2 vols. (Oxford, 1911). The ongoing book-by-book critical edition by Belles Lettres mostly does not alter the division of Isidore's text. While not all twenty books of the *Etymologiae* have yet appeared in this editorial series, books VI and VII, cited with a particular frequency in this paper, were published as César Chaparro-Gomez, ed., *Etymologias Libro VI - Isidore de Séville*, Auteurs latins du Moyen Âge 23 (Paris, 2012); and *Étymologies Livre VII - Isidore de Séville*, ed. Jean-Yves Guillaumin and Pierre Monat, Auteurs latins du Moyen Âge 24 (Paris, 2012).

⁸ The manuscript is cropped at the beginning. The lower part of fol. 5r, the blank fol. 5v, and the lower margins of fols. 6r-7r were later filled with an anonymous text on weights and measures by a younger early medieval hand belonging presumably to a later user. These additions are edited in Fridericus Hultsch, *Metrologicorum scriptorum reliquiae.*, 2 vols. (Leipzig, 1866), 2:263–64.

dogma. Moreover, the section *De legibus* from book V of the *Etymologiae* is commonly found in Carolingian manuscripts of secular law. ⁹ It has been suggested that it was used in the education of Carolingian law practitioners, ¹⁰ and for this reason, it would also be valuable for someone being trained for high-level ecclesiastical office. While the chapters on weights and measures are not directly relevant for clerical training, they represent a snippet of valuable knowledge of the kind that can be found in personal notebooks from the Carolingian period and which a holder of an ecclesiastical office might find useful. Thus, even in the absence of tell-tale expositions of the Creed, Lord's Prayer, the mass, and baptism, Aurelian's little book should be considered a handbook for a cleric. ¹¹

As will be argued in this paper, **St. Gall 879** is no isolated occurrence but a relatively ordinary specimen of a notable type of collection intended for priests that emerged in the Carolingian environment in the late eighth and the first half of the ninth centuries. These collections were assembled from snippets of the *Etymologiae* (and to a lesser extent of other works of Isidore of Seville), being cleverly selected and shuffled to furnish them with a

⁹ Ernest-Joseph Tardif, "Un abrégé juridique des Étymologies d'Isidore de Séville," in *Mélanges Julien Havet: Recueil de travaux d'érudition dédiés à la mémoire de Julien Havet* (Paris, 1895), pp. 659–81, at 660–63; John J. Contreni, "The Carolingian Renaissance: Education and Literary Culture," in *The New Cambridge Medieval History*, ed. Rosamond McKitterick (Cambridge, 1995), 2:709–57, at 749; and Carmen Cardelle de Hartmann, "Uso y recepción de las Etymologiae de Isidoro," in *Wisigothica. After M. C. Díaz y Díaz*, ed. Carmen Codoñer and Paulo Farmhouse Alberto, mediEVI 3 (Florence, 2014), pp. 477–502, at 485. ¹⁰ Rosamond McKitterick, *The Carolingians and the Written Word* (Cambridge, 1989), pp. 45–47.

¹¹ Manuscripts for priests as a category began to attract attention in the last decades. Among the studies dealing with this category of manuscripts, see Niels Krogh Rasmussen, "Célébration épiscopale et célébration presbytérale: un essai de typologie," in *Segni e riti nella chiesa altomedievale occidentale*, Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto medioevo 33 (Spoleto, 1987), pp. 581–600; Yitzhak Hen, "Knowledge of Canon Law among Rural Priests: The Evidence of Two Carolingian Manuscripts from around 800," *The Journal of Theological Studies* 50 (1999), 117–34; Susan Keefe, *Water and the Word: Baptism and the Education of the Clergy in the Carolingian Empire*, Publications in Mediaeval Studies, 2 vols. (Notre Dame, Ind., 2002); Carine van Rhijn, "The Local Church, Priests' Handbooks and Pastoral Care in the Carolingian Period," in *Chiese locali e chiese regionali nell'alto medioevo*, Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto medioevo 61 (Spoleto, 2014), pp. 689–706; Steffen Patzold, "Correctio an der Basis: Landpfarrer und ihr Wissen im 9. Jahrhundert," in *Karolingische Klöster. Wissenstransfer und kulturelle Innovation*, ed. Julia Becker, Tino Licht, and Stefan Weinfurter, Materiale Textkulturen 4 (Berlin, 2015), pp. 227–54; Steffen Patzold, "Pater Noster: Priests and the Religious Instruction of the Laity in the Carolingian 'populus Christianus," and Carine van Rhijn, "Manuscripts for Local Priests and the Carolingian Reforms," in *Men in the Middle. Local Priests in Early Medieval Europe*, ed. Carine van Rhijn and Steffen Patzold, Ergänzungsbände Zum Reallexikon der Germanischen Altertumskunde 93 (Berlin, 2016), pp. 177–98 and 199–221; and Carine van Rhijn, *Leading the Way to Heaven: Pastoral Care and Salvation in the Carolingian Period*, The Medieval World (London, 2022), pp. 52–84.

catechetical function and make them suitable for clerical training and use. As these compilations contain little or no original material, they are easy to overlook or miscategorise as miscellaneous excerpts from Isidore's writings. Nevertheless, their function as compilations intended for the education and use of clergy can be discerned from the selection of material they contain, their structure, the occasional titles under which they circulated in the Middle Ages, and the manuscript context in which they are preserved.

These Isidorean collections fit into a broader early medieval trend of excerption of "useful" material from the *Etymologiae*. ¹² Already in the seventh century, material from Isidore's encyclopaedia began to be excerpted, recontextualised, and reordered, and in this manner appropriated for novel uses that went beyond the original encyclopaedic scope of the work. In fact, material from the *Etymologiae* circulated in the early Middle Ages more commonly in these non-encyclopaedic contexts than in its entirety as an encyclopaedia. ¹³ Examining the passages from the *Etymologiae* which were most frequently excerpted and in which novel contexts they were recast, we can distinguish several *foci* of extraction that reveal early medieval interests, needs, and regional and supraregional trends and preferences. It turns out that books VI-VIII of the *Etymologiae* dealing with God, the Church, the Bible, and matters pertaining to Christian dogma and rite were among the most commonly selected for repurposing in the early Middle Ages. ¹⁴ Excerpts from these books also occur in manuscripts described as books for priests or

¹² Cardelle de Hartmann, "Uso y recepción," pp. 482–84. As early as 1913, C.H. Beeson recorded many instances of material from Isidore's most important work transmitted other than as a whole, drawing conclusions about the popularity of specific books and topics; see Charles Henry Beeson, *Isidor-Studien*, Quellen und Untersuchungen zur lateinischen Philologie des Mittelalters 4.2 (Munich, 1913), p. 83.

¹³ The recently completed survey of the early medieval manuscripts transmitting the *Etymologiae* showed that more than 70% of surviving and identified pre-1000 manuscripts transmitting Isidore's work are manuscripts transmitting a selection from this text; see Evina Steinová, "The Oldest Manuscript Tradition of the Etymologiae (Eighty Years after A.E. Anspach)," *Visigothic Symposium* 4 (2020), 100–43, at p. 114.

¹⁴ Material from book VI can be found in 86 pre-1000 manuscripts not containing the complete *Etymologiae* more often than material from any other book transmitted in such a non-encyclopaedic context. Material from book VII appears in 62 such manuscripts, and material from book VIII in 52 such manuscripts. This data is taken from the *Innovating Knowledge* database at: https://db.innovatingknowledge.nl/ (accessed on 28/02/2022). A useful comparison of the extent of selective transmission of

connected with their instruction and office. ¹⁵ In many of them, we encounter a unique combination of excerpts from these and other books of the *Etymologiae* so that two manuscripts containing Isidorean excerpts are rarely alike. Nevertheless, examining the rich forest of Isidorean material in early medieval manuscripts, several stable collections with a pronounced catechetic focus can be identified as recurring in multiple manuscripts. Unlike the assortment of texts in **St. Gall 879**, they were not just personalised selections of useful material but rather well-defined, albeit anonymous, textual compilations that circulated widely and may have enjoyed substantial popularity.

Carolingian Isidorean collections for priests with a substantial diffusion

In the following paragraphs, I describe and analyse four well-preserved collections of Isidorean material intended for priests. As will be shown, they display many mutual similarities and share common features with texts previously connected with the education of and use for priests. The four collections have all survived in at least four early medieval manuscripts. They have no known authors-compilers, and only some have a fixed title that consistently appears in

various books, albeit based on outdated information, can be found in Steinová, "The Oldest Manuscript Tradition of the Etymologiae," p. 123. See also Jacques Fontaine, "La Figure d'Isidore de Séville à l'époque carolingienne," in *L'Europe héritière de l'Espagne wisigothique: Colloque international du C.N.R.S. tenu à la Fondation Singer-Polignac*, ed. Jacques Fontaine and Christine Pellistrandi (Madrid, 1992), pp. 176–192, at 177.

¹⁵ To give just a few examples of such manuscripts, in **Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS lat. 1008** (saec. IX/X, France, prov.: Saint Denis), we find a set of clerical *interrogationes et responsiones* paraphrasing *Etym.* VII 12.1 and 11; see Keefe, *Water and the Word*, 2:67. In **Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS lat. 2994A** (saec. IX, Septimania), an excerpt collection about cantors includes parts of both *Etym.* VI 19 (*De officiis*) and *Etym.* VII 12 (*De clericis*) dealing with cantors and liturgical chant. While not identified as a handbook for a cleric so far, this manuscript measuring only 142 x 118 mm is presumably another personal handbook, perhaps owned by a cantor. In **Bern, Burgerbibliothek, MS 611** (saec. VIII^{1/2}, Bourges), snippets from *Etym.* VI 19 on fasting and penance were copied in Tironian notes on fols. 90v-91r. This manuscript has been connected with clerical training in David Ganz, "In the Circle of the Bishop of Bourges: Bern 611 and Late Merovingian Culture," in *East and West in the Early Middle Ages. The Merovingian Kingdoms in Mediterranean Perspective*, ed. Stefan Esders, Yaniv Fox, Yitzhak Hen, and Laury Sarti (Cambridge, 2019), pp. 265–80, at 274. Finally, two manuscripts transmitting the *Collectio duorum librorum*, **Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, n.a.l. 452** (ca. 830, Salzburg) and **Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS lat. 407** (saec. IX^{3/4}, area of St. Gall), contain an excerpt of *Etym.* VI 19.57-58 dealing with the Creed; see Susan Keefe, *A Catalogue of Works Pertaining to the Explanation of the Creed in Carolingian Manuscripts*, Instrumenta Patristica et Mediaevalia 63 (Turnhout, 2012), pp. 182, 329–30, and 367.

manuscripts. Therefore, I either refer to them by a title under which they are found in some of the manuscripts or, if they are transmitted without a title, assign them a convenient label. They are treated in the order of the number of surviving and identified witnesses (from 14 to 4). As they consist primarily, but often not exclusively, of excerpts of known texts, their full significance can be appreciated only if their structure and content are presented in some detail. Therefore, each of the descriptions is accompanied by a tabular overview of the principal items of the collection, their sources, and the topics they treat. However, some of the collections were laboriously assembled from such a large number of small snippets that reproducing them all would make this paper considerably longer. If too complex, therefore, I shorten the overview of items constituting a collection, providing an approximate list of sources and topics. The complete overview of known witnesses of each collection is provided separately in the first section of the appendix.

De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris et de baptismatis officio

An anonymous collection bearing the following incipit *In Dei nomine pauca ex eruditorum virorum voluminibus excerpta incipiunt de catholica ecclesia et eius ministris et de baptismatis officio* survives in at least 14 medieval manuscripts, including in 4 codices dated to the ninth and the tenth centuries: **Sélestat, Bibliothèque humaniste, MS 132** (saec. IX^{med.}, Mainz), **St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 446** (saec. IX^{3/4}, St. Gall), **Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Pal. lat. 485** (saec. IX^{3/4}, Lorsch), and **Fulda, Hochschul- und Landesbibliothek, MS Aa 2** (saec. X, Bodensee area). ¹⁶ While the four oldest witnesses come from the German area,

¹⁶ The Sélestat manuscript is briefly described in Paul Adam, "Catalogue sommaire des Manuscrits de la bibliothèque humaniste de Sélestat," in *L'Humanisme à Sélestat. L'école, les humanistes, la bibliothèque* (Sélestat, 1978), pp. 95–145, at 111. At 169 x 101 mm, it is another likely candidate for a personal notebook. The St. Gall manuscript is described in Gustav Scherrer, *Verzeichniss Der Handschriften Der Stiftsbibliothek von St. Gallen* (Halle a. d. Saale, 1875), pp. 144–46. The Fulda manuscript is described in Regina Hausmann, *Die Theologischen Handschriften der Hessischen Landesbibliothek Fulda bis zum Jahr 1600. Codices Bonifatiani 1-3, Aa 1-145a*, Die Handschriften Der Hessischen Landesbibliothek Fulda 1 (Wiesbaden, 1992), pp. 16–23. **Pal. lat.**

subscriptions to the incipit appearing in the St. Gall manuscript (*istud a palatio Aquisgrani venit*) as well as in a group of more recent Italian manuscripts (*Ista capitula a palatio Aquisgrani venierunt*) suggest that the collection has a Frankish provenance and more specifically may have been disseminated from the palace in Aachen. The version of the collection in manuscripts with the subscription also features a baptismal instruction by Alcuin as the chapter *De mysteriis sacri baptismatis*, ¹⁷ and the anonymous commentary on the mass *Dominus vobiscum*. ¹⁸ As Alcuin's baptismal instruction can be dated to 798 and the mass commentary to the 790s, we possess an important *terminus post quem* for this longer version of *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris*, consisting of eight textual elements:

#	title in manuscripts	content	topic
1	(incipit)	Etym. VIII 1.1 + De officiis I 1.3	Church
2	De ministris aecclesiae	Etym. VII 12.1-3	priests
3	De gradibus aecclesiasticis	Etym. VII 12.4-6, 9-13, 17, 20-33	priests
4	De ceteris fidelibus	Etym. VII 14.5-8, 10, 9	laypeople
5	De baptismo	Etym. VI 19.43-47	baptism
6	De mysteriis sacri baptismatis	Alcuin, <i>Epp.</i> 134 ¹⁹	baptism

⁴⁸⁵ is described in detail in Frederick S. Paxton, "Bonus Liber: A Late Carolingian Clerical Manual from Lorsch (Biblioteca Vaticana MS Pal. Lat. 485)," in *The Two Laws. Studies in Medieval Legal History Dedicated to Stephan Kuttner*, ed. Laurent Mayali and Stephanie A. J. Tibbetts (Washington, D.C., 1990), pp. 1–30. Unless stated otherwise, the dates and places of the origin of manuscripts in this paper are taken from Bernhard Bischoff, *Katalog der festländischen Handschriften des neunten Jahrhunderts* (*mit Ausnahme der wisigotischen*), ed. Birgit Ebersperger, 4 vols., Veröffentlichungen der Kommission für die Herausgabe der mittelalterlichen Bibliothekskataloge Deutschlands und der Schweiz (Wiesbaden, 1998-2017).

¹⁷ This text was edited in the MGH both as a part of Alcuin's letter 134 to Oduin and his letter 137 to the monks of Septimania; see Alcuin, *Epistolae*, ed. Ernst Dümmler, MGH Epp. 4 (Berlin, 1895), pp. 202-03 and 210-16. Susan Keefe also edited it as a separately transmitted baptismal instruction for this is how it appears in many manuscripts with a connection to priests and bishops; Keefe, *Water and the Word*, 2:238–45.

¹⁸ The mass commentary *Dominus vobiscum*, formerly attributed to Amalarius of Metz, is edited in *Amalarii Episcopi Opera liturgica omnia*, ed. Jean Michel Hanssens, Studi e testi 138, 3 vols. (Vatican City, 1948), 1:284–338. It is also analysed in Carine van Rhijn, "'Ut missarum preces bene intellegant'. The Dominus Vobiscum, a Carolingian Mass Commentary for the Education of Priests," *Revue Mabillon* 31 (2020), 7–28; and Rhijn, *Leading the Way to Heaven*, pp. 129–38. For its dating, see Rhijn, "'Ut missarum preces bene intellegant'," p. 13.

¹⁹ The text of the letter is not reproduced here completely, but only from the words *in illo officio*, as in a number of other catechetic manuscripts, in which it appears as an independent baptismal instruction; see Keefe, *Water and the Word*, 2:239.

7	De officiis	Etym. VI 19.1, 5-8, 24	mass
8	Expositio super missam	mass commentary Dominus vobiscum	mass

A shorter version consisting of only items 1-5 survives in **Sélestat 132** and **Pal. lat. 485**, the two oldest witnesses of *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris*. These two manuscripts also carry no subscription. The longer version features in most other witnesses beginning with the ninthcentury St. Gall 446. Once we compare the different versions, the shorter one looks like an older undeveloped form of *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris*, particularly as the elements it lacks (items 6-8) are attested as independently circulating texts on baptism and the mass in manuscripts for priests. In fact, if we consider items 1-5 to be a single self-standing unit, the longer version appears to be a later compilation of four entities: an Isidorean collection of excerpts from books VI-VIII of the Etymologiae (items 1-5), Alcuin's baptismal exposition (item 6), a text edited by Keefe as *De baptismo* (item 7), and the popular mass commentary *Dominus* vobiscum (item 8). In light of the absence of the Aachen subscription from the two witnesses of the short version, it can be hypothesised that only the compilation of the longer version, rather than of the entire De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris, should be attributed to the palace environs. Indeed, the layered character of *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris* consisting of an older core and a younger elaboration is characteristic of the Isidorean catechetic collections discussed in this paper, and we will see other examples below.

The *terminus ante quem* for both versions of the collection is provided by the oldest manuscript as mid ninth century. However, given the Aachen connection, we should perhaps assume that *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris* was compiled in the first two decades of the ninth century, with the shorter version compiled earlier and perhaps in a similar environment. The two manuscripts transmitting the short version are German, suggesting that this old core did

not originate in Francia. However, the pattern of early survival in the German-speaking region may be more indicative of regional popularity and preferences rather than inform us about the *loci* of origin of the different versions (for example, because *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris* was displaced early on in western Frankish territories by other collections). This is also how we should interpret the re-emergence of this Carolingian catechetic collection in central Italy, where at least eight manuscripts containing the long version of *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris* were copied in the eleventh and the twelfth centuries. ²⁰ The fact that the subscription found in this Italian group has a different form from the one attested in **St. Gall 446** and other manuscripts puts them into a separate branch of transmission, although they were shown to be related to the St. Gall manuscript and descend from the Bodensee area. ²¹ The two remaining post-1000 witnesses, **Einsiedeln, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 110** (saec. XI²) and **St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 777** (saec. XII), both connected to St. Gall, are in all likelihood copied from **St. Gall 446**. ²²

The text of the longer version of *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris* was published on the basis of the Einsiedeln manuscript by Gerbert in his *Monumenta veteris liturgiae alemannicae* in 1779.²³ The collection is briefly discussed in Andrieu's *Les ordines romani du haut moyen age*.²⁴ Keefe and van Rhijn discuss the manuscripts transmitting the collection due to their interest in

21

²⁰ At the head of this Italian group seems to be **Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Vat. lat. 1147** (saec. XI², Polirone), which is a parent of several of the more recent Italian manuscripts. See also Rhijn, "'Ut missarum preces bene intellegant'," pp. 19–20. To this Italian group presumably also belong **Naples, Biblioteca Nazionale Vittorio Emanuele III, MS VI.E.41** (saec. XII) and **Milan, Biblioteca Ambrosiana, MS H 48 sup.** (saec. XII, Italy). I am grateful to Carine van Rhijn, who provided me information about the former manuscript. The contents of the latter manuscript are described in Mirella Ferrari, "Dopo Bernardo: biblioteche e 'scriptoria' cisterciensi dell'Italia settentrionale nel XII secolo," in *San Bernardo e l'Italia: atti del convegno di studi, Milano, 24-26 maggio 1990*, ed. Pietro Zerbi, Bibliotheca erudita 9 (Milan, 1993), pp. 253–306, at 281–85.

²¹ Michel Andrieu, *Les ordines romani du haut moyen âge*, 5 vols., Spicilegium sacrum Lovaniense 11 (Louvain, 1931), 1:482–84. ²² See Scherrer, *Verzeichniss Der Handschriften Der Stiftsbibliothek von St. Gallen*, p. 258; Hartmut Hoffmann, *Schreibschulen des 10. und des 11. Jahrhunderts im Südwesten des Deutschen Reichs*, 2 vols., Monumenta Germaniae Historica Schriften 53 (Hannover, 2004), 1:72; and the description of **Einsiedeln 110** prepared by P. Odo Lang (OSB) for e-codices.ch; at: https://www.e-codices.unifr.ch/en/description/sbe/0110/ (accessed on 28/02/2022).

²³ Martin Gerbert, *Monumenta veteris liturgiae alemannicae*, 4 vols. (Saint Blaise, 1779), 2:291–93.

²⁴ Andrieu, Les ordines romani, 1:338 and 1:479–80.

some of the constituent textual items.²⁵ As of yet, however, the collection has been neither edited nor studied critically.

Collectio unde

At least twelve medieval manuscripts transmit in full or in part a collection of *interrogationes* and *responsiones* derived from the *Etymologiae* and several other texts. In a group of important witnesses, this collection bears the incipit *Summum bonum Deus est*, the first sentence of Isidore's *Sententiae*. ²⁶ In order to avoid confusion with the *Sententiae* and since most of the questions in this anonymous collection begin with an *unde* (whence), I shall call it the *Collectio unde*. Unlike *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris*, *Collectio unde* is not merely a pastiche of other texts. The compilers of this collection should be credited with coming up with individual questions, which were tailored to particular passages from the *Etymologiae* in such a way that the latter provides the sought-after answer. They also made notable adjustments to some of the Isidorean passages.

Like *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris*, the *Collectio unde* survives in two versions, of which one consisting of 74 questions and answers survives in the majority of known witnesses. The following table provides an overview of the contents of this 74-question version, providing only the first question dealing with a specific theme:

#	title in the manuscripts (order)	content	topic

²⁵ Keefe edited items 6 and 7 of *De catholica ecclesia* dealing with baptism as her texts 9 and 60 in Keefe, *Water and the Word*, 2:238–45 and 2:629–30. Rhijn is interested in the mass commentary *Dominus vobiscum*, listing manuscripts transmitting this text, including those in which it appears attached to *De catholica ecclesia*, in Rhijn, "'Ut missarum preces bene intellegant'," pp. 26–28.

²⁶ Isidore, Sententiae I 1.1, ed. Pierre Cazier, Isidorus Hispalensis. Liber sententiarum, CCSL 111 (Turnhout, 1998), p. 7.

1-2	Quid est Deus (1)	Ambrosiaster, Quaestiones	God
		veteris et novi testamenti 1.2 +	
		2.1	
3-	Unde dictus est Christus (3)	Etym. VII 2.2-3, 7, 6, 10-14	Christ
10			
11-	Unde Spiritus Sanctus dicitur	Etym. VII 3.1-8, 10-13	Holy Ghost
16	Deus (11)		
17	Unde dicta est Trinitas et Unitas	unknown source ²⁷	Trinity
18-	Unde dicuntur angeli (18)	Etym. VII 5.1-6, 17, 19, 18, 21,	angels
27		20, 22, 24	
28	Unde dicuntur prophetae	Etym. VII 8.1	Prophets
29	Unde dicti sunt apostoli	Etym. VII 9.1	Apostles
30	Unde dicti sunt martyres	Etym. VII 11.1-2	martyrs
31-	Unde dicitur clericus (31)	Etym. VII 12.1-15, 17, 20-24,	priests
44		29-33	
45-	Unde dicuntur monachi (45)	<i>Etym.</i> VII 13.1-3, 5 + unique	monks
48		additions ²⁸	
49-	Unde dicitur Cristianus (49)	Etym. VII 14.1, 4-9	lay people
55			
56	Unde dicitur ecclesia	Etym. VIII 1.1, 3, 7	Church

²⁷ Paris lat. 2175, fol. 102r: *Quia Deus unus est in trinitate et trinus in unitate. In personis trinus quia persona Patris, persona Filii, persona spiritus sancti, et unus in trinitate, quia unus in divinitate, in magestate (sic!), in potestate, in eaternitate (sic!), in substantia divinitatis, in essentia, in natura, et ita veratiter unus et trinus.* This unique text corresponds in its sequence to *Etym.* VII 4 (*De trinitate*) although it is not derived from Isidore.

²⁸ Paris lat. 2175, fol. 105r: Coenobium enim plurimorum est congregatio, eo quod plurime (sic!) in uno debent (sic!, corr. degunt) monasterio monachi quam (sic!, corr. monachicam) qui sub unius abbatis custodia conservant vitam quam (sic!) Apostoli imitantur. Compare with Etym. VII 13.2: Coenobitae, quos nos In commune viventes possumus appellare. Coenobium enim plurimorum est.

57-	Unde dicta est religio (57)	Etym. VIII 2.2-6	religion
60			
61-	Unde hereses dicuntur (61)	<i>Etym.</i> VIII 3.1, 5, 4, 6 + unique	heresy
63		additions ²⁹	
64	Unde dicuntur Pharisei et	Etym. VIII 4.3-4	Pharisees and
	Sadducei		Sadducees
65-	Unde dicuntur philosophi (65)	Etym. VIII 6.1, 3-6	philosophers
68			
69	Unde exorta est linguarum	Etym. IX 1.1	language
	diversitas		
70	Unde dicitur gens	Etym. IX 2.1-2	gentes
71-	Unde dicitur regnum (71)	Etym. IX 3.1-4, 12, 14, 17 +	kingdoms,
74		additions ³⁰	kings, Caesars,
			and emperors

As can be gleaned from the table, the 74-question version of the *Collectio unde* follows the order of material presented in the *Etymologiae*, beginning with the definitions of God, Christ, and the Holy Spirit in book VII and ending with the discussion of *gentes*, kingdoms, kings, Caesars, and

²⁹ Paris lat. 2175, fols. 106r-106v: Heres graece, Latine scisma sive electio dicitur, eo quod uniusquisque sibi elegit quod melius illi esse videtur, ut philosophi qui dicuntur Perpateti et Academici, Epicurei atque Stoici diversa sentientes de Deo et perversum dogma excogitantes arbitrio suo ab ecclesia recesserunt, argumentisque diversis de unitate deitatis male sentiendo et ecclesiae fidem aliter quam est dividendo scismam fecerunt, alius sic, alius quidem sic, quoniam scisma ab sciscura animorum vocata est. Compare with Etym. VIII 3.1: Haeresis Graece ab electione vocatur, quod scilicet unusquisque id sibi eligat quod melius illi esse videtur, ut philosophi Peripatetici, Academici, et Epicurei et Stoici, vel sicut alii qui perversum dogma cogitantes arbitrio suo de Ecclesia recesserunt; and Etym. VIII 3.5: Schisma ab scissura animorum vocata.

³⁰ To item 73 (unde dictus est Caesar), Paris lat. 2175, fols. 107v-108r: ... vel quod cum caesarea natus sit, id est a coma, et sicut caesar Grecae, Latine possessio principalis, ita et Augustus Grecae, Latine solemniter stans interpretatur. Similarly, to item 74 (unde dicuntur imperatores), Paris lat. 2175, fol. 108r: ... nam et Octavianus dicitur imperator, Caesar et Augustus. Imperator ab imperando, Caesar a coma sive a possessione principali, Augustus quia solemniter stabat.

emperors in book IX. The unique formulations of answers to items 17 (Trinity) and 46 (monks) and the additions to item 61 (heresy) are likely original contributions of the compilers.³¹ The rephrasing of Isidore's definition of a monastery in item 46 and the presence of a heading *capitulum de monachis* before item 45, the only such element in the 74-question version, point to an origin in a monastic setting. Items 73 (Caesars) and 74 (emperors) contain identical additions that have their origin in Jerome's *Liber interpretationis hebraicorum nominum*.³² The last four *interrogationes* and *responsiones* in the 74-question version are a unique feature among the catechetic collections discussed here or described by others, given their focus on secular power. They are hardly accidental. Given the culmination of the short version with *caesar* and *imperator*, they seem to reveal the compilers of this version as either working closely with the Carolingian court or as being directly invested in the Carolingian imperial ideology.

The manuscript context in which the 74-question version of *Collectio unde* survives is revealing. Although it was certainly conceived as a self-sufficient textual entity, it survives today exclusively embedded in a larger collection of anonymous material with an exegetical focus that was probably put together for the benefit of priests.³³ As François Dolbeau showed, this super-

³¹ The latter interpolation refers to certain groups causing a schism by reaching wrong conclusions about the unity of God by using different arguments and by "splitting the faith of the Church otherwise than it is" (argumentisque diversis de unitate deitatis male sentiendo et ecclesiae fidem aliter quam est dividendo, scisma fecerunt). The answer to Unde dicta est trinitas et unitas (item 17) likewise stressed the unity of God in its various dimensions strengthening the impression that the compilers of the Collectio unde were preoccupied with this theological issue. However, it does not seem to reflect a particular historical reality of the early Carolingian period that would allow us to situate the Collectio unde within the context of a specific theological debate. I would like to thank Warren Pezé for consultation on this matter.

³² Compare footnote 30 with *Caesar. possessio principalis* and *Augusti. Sollemniter stantis* in Jerome, *Liber interpretationis hebraicorum nominum*, ed. Paul de Legarde, *S. Hieronymi presbyteri opera* I, CCSL 72 (Turnhout, 1959), p. 64. The form in which the two glosses appear in the *Collectio unde* is closer to that in which they can be found in several early medieval texts with an Irish continental pedigree, such as in the anonymous Commentary on Luke from eighth-century Salzburg; ed. Joseph F. Kelly, *Scriptores Hiberniae minores* II, CCSL 108C (Turnhout, 1974); and the *Homiliarum Veronense* from early ninth-century Verona; ed. L.T. Martin, *Homiliarium Veronense*, CCCM 186 (Turnhout, 2000), p. 7.

³³ This exegetical super-collection consists of twelve items, including Gennadius of Marseilles's *De ecclesiasticis dogmatibus*, the *Expositio quattuor evangeliorum* attributed to Gregory the Great, Isidore's *Allegoriae*, an anonymous treatise *De septiformis spiritu sancti*, a ps. Augustinian sermon on Luke 11.5-13, various anonymous *interrogationes et responsiones* about letters and the Bible, a short anonymous text on clerical grades, an excerpt from the baptismal text with the title *Chronica sancti Hieronymi*, an excerpt from Theodulf of Orléans's *De divinis scripturis*, and the anonymous *Dicta Leonis episcopi*. The 74-question version of the *Collectio unde* appears between the ps. Augustinian sermon and the *interrogationes et responsiones*. The contexts and the history

collection contains two unique texts from the environs of the Carolingian court datable to 798: an excerpt from a letter of Alcuin and an otherwise unknown invocation addressed to Charlemagne. Dolbeau also thought that the super-collection originated in the environs of the Carolingian court. Since its oldest witness, and the oldest witness of the short version of the *Collectio unde*, **Paris**, **Bibliothèque nationale de France**, **MS lat. 2175** from southwestern Germany can be dated to the beginning of the ninth century, we have a rather tight chronological window into which the compilation of the exegetical super-collection should be situated. While it does not necessarily follow that the 74-question version itself came into being at the same time, its concluding questions, in particular the interest in Caesars and emperors, strongly suggests a date of origin around or shortly after 800.

Apart from the seven complete witnesses identified by Michael Gorman³⁶ and two newly identified ninth-century fragments transmitting the 74-question version,³⁷ the *Collectio unde* survives in three additional manuscripts that do not represent this version. Like in the case of *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris*, they reveal that other versions of the *Collectio unde* existed apart from the one diffused from the circles close to Charlemagne. The most substantial of these appears in **Montecassino**, **Archivio dell'Abbazia**, **MS 29** (saec. X/XI, area of Rome), in which we find 162 questions and answers taken from the *Etymologiae* under the incipit *Incipit de*

of this super-collection are discussed in Michael Gorman, "The Carolingian Miscellany of Exegetical Texts in Albi 39 and Paris Lat. 2175," Scriptorium 51 (1997), 336–54.

³⁴ François Dolbeau, "Du nouveau sur un Sermonnaire de Cambridge," *Scriptorium* 42 (1988), 255–57, at p. 256.

³⁵ Michael Gorman rather thought that the two short texts pointing to the court were integrated into the larger exegetical collection by accident as a later addition. In his opinion, this collection is older and original to southern France rather than to the area in the geographic proximity of the Carolingian court; Gorman, "The Carolingian Miscellany of Exegetical Texts," pp. 337 and 354.

³⁶ Gorman, "The Carolingian Miscellany of Exegetical Texts," p. 336.

³⁷ These are **Leiden, Universiteitsbibliotheek, MS Voss. Lat. Q 122 (fols. 89-96)** (saec. IX^{3/4}, western France [?]) and **Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS lat. 1205 (fol. II)** (saec. IX^{1/3}, France). The former is a fragment containing a part of the larger exegetical collection in which the 74-question version of the *Collectio unde* was transmitted in the early Middle Ages not containing the text of the latter, but evidently representing a remnant of such a manuscript. The latter is a fragment containing the text of the *Collectio Unde*.

trinitate.³⁸ This extensive collection includes the 74 questions found in the shorter version of the *Collectio unde* but also an additional 20 questions based on *Etym*. VI 19 (*De officiis*) inserted into the middle of this sequence, ³⁹ 2 questions derived from sources others than the *Etymologiae*, ⁴⁰ and 65 questions taken from books IX, VI, and I-V of the *Etymologiae* following the last questions that are known from the 74-question version, *Unde dicuntur imperatores* (*Etym*. IX 3.14). ⁴¹ Moreover, the Montecassino manuscript features several rubricated titles giving the large collection a structure, including the heading *capitulum de monachis* that we saw earlier. ⁴² The longer version, too, includes short additions and interpolations in the answers gathered from Isidore's text, some from known texts and others original to the compilers of the collection. ⁴³ The most intriguing of these other sources is certainly Paul the Deacon's epitome of

³⁸ This text is briefly described in Mauro Inguanez, *Catalogi codicum Casinensium antiqui*, Miscellanea Cassinese 21 (Montecassino, 1941), p. 37. It has not yet been studied or published. I was able to transcribe it from digital images provided by the abbey library of Monte Cassino. The manuscript is discussed in José Carlos Martín Iglesias, "El tratado 'Item aliae quaestiones in quibus sunt nonnulle de Genesi': conservado en Montecassino, Biblioteca dell'Abbazia, 29. edición y estudio," *Sacris erudiri* 50 (2011), 341–412; and Lukas Dorfbauer, "Zwei Florilegien von theologischen interrogationes und responsiones in Monte Cassino: Item aliae questiones in quibus sunt nonnulle de Genesi (Bibl. Abb. 29) und Item questionem veteris testamenti (Bibl. Abb. 187)," *Sacris Erudiri* 51 (2012), 257–85.

³⁹ More specifically, the 20 questions *De officiis* appear between questions *Unde dicitur caritas* (item 60, *Etym.* VIII 2.6) and *Unde hereses dicuntur* (here item 81, in the 74-question version item 61, *Etym.* VIII 3.1).

⁴⁰ These are a second *Quid est Deus* (item 2) based for the most part on Ambrosiaster's *Quaestiones veteris et novi testamenti*, and *Quot sunt genera clericorum* (item 33) based on Isidore's *De ecclesiasticis officiis*. The passage from *De officiis* was quoted by several Carolingian documents, such as the canons of the Synod of Aachen (816), in a form closer to that of the *Collectio unde*; see *Concilium Aquisgranense 816* 101, ed. Albert Werminghoff, MGH Conc. 2,1 (Leipzig, 1906), p. 378. In addition, while the 74-question version discusses bishops and archbishops in a single item 34 (corresponding to *Etym*. VII 12.6-8, 11-12), these two offices are treated in separate items 36 and 37 in the 162-question version of the *Collectio unde* (as *Unde dictus est archiepiscopus* and *Unde dictus est episcopus*).

⁴¹ These questions treat, in the order of their appearance, secular offices, the military, *populus*, and kinship (book IX), holy days, prayer, fasting, penance, and again holy days (book VI), *ars*, letters, grammar, the noun, the gloss, prose, and history (book I), rhetoric, law, dialectic, and philosophy (book II), the four disciplines of the *quadrivium*, world, heavens, sun, and moon (book III), medicine and health (book IV), and day, night, week, solstice and equinox, four seasons, and year (book V).

⁴² The other *tituli* include *Item de officiis divinis* (before the twenty questions taken from *Etym.* VI 19), *capitula de heresi* (before item 81: *Unde hereses dicuntur*), *capitula de filiis et parentibus* (before item 105: *Unde dicuntur filii*), and *De temporibus* (before item 153: *Unde dictus est dies*).

⁴³ To give just a few examples, we find them added to item 73 (*Unde dicitur sacrificium, Etym.* VI 19.38-42): ... quae est panis et calicis sanctificatio, et ex eis per mysterium Dei efficitur corpus et sanguis Christi; item 79 (*Unde dicitur symbolum, Etym.* VI 19.57-58): ... proprie autem symbolum Grecae collatio vel collectio dicitur; item 105 (*Unde dicuntur filii, Etym.* IX 5.15-16) between two segments taken from Etym. IX 5.16: ... quod nulli licet Christiano doctrinam nescire, sicut ait Apostolus: "Filioli mei quos iterum parturio, donec formetur Christus in vobis ...; item 111 (*Unde dicta est oratio, Etym.* VI 19.59): ... Orationis tempora iuxta Psalmistam sunt septem, sicut ait: "Septies in die laudem dixi tibi", sive septies pro semper posuit, ut illud: "Benedicam Dominum in omni tempore'; item 112 (*Unde dictum est ieiunium, Etym.* VI 19.65): ... Ieiunium enim et helemosyna duae sunt alae volandi ad Deum. Ieiunium enim ut quidam sapiens ait: "Res sancta, opus caeleste, ianua regni, forma futuri, quod qui sancte agit, Deo iungitur, alienatur mundo, spiritualis efficitur'; item 122 (*Unde dicta est celebritas, Etym.* VI 18.2): ... ut Apostolus ait: "In psalmis et ymnis et canticis spiritalibus cantantes et psallentes in cordibus vestris Deo'; and item 125 (*Unde dicta est Epiphania, Etym.* VI 18.6-7): ... In ipsis enim manifestatur gentium populus crediturus. Et quoniam ea die baptizatur Christus, aquamque in

Festus.⁴⁴ Importantly, the 162-question version differs from the 74-question version of the *Collectio unde* in its focus. The short version contains only material from books VII-IX of the *Etymologiae* and has, as a result, a prominently catechetic tone (with a dash of secular imperial ideology), while the long version has a more eclectic scope and should be perhaps considered a school text or a learned study tool.

Two other manuscripts transmit selections from the *Collectio unde*. **Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Reg. lat. 1587 (fols. 51-56)** (saec. IX^{3/4}, western France, prov.:

Fleury) transmits on fols. 51r-53r a condensed collection of definitions from the *Etymologiae*, which can be identified based on the order of the material and several embedded questions at the beginning (e.g. *Unde dictus est Christus* and *Unde bis genitus dicitur Christus*) as an abridgement of the 74-question version. After the last recognisable item of the 74-question version (emperors), the text in this manuscript continues with additional items treating children, books, and the world, some, albeit not all, of which can be traced back to other sections of the larger exegetical collection into which the 74-question version was embedded.⁴⁵ **Troyes**,

vinum convertit, de quinque panibus ac duobus piscibus quinque milia hominum satiavit. A parallel to the addition to item 79 can be found in the biblical glosses on Proverbs preserved in **Milan, Biblioteca Ambrosiana, MS M 79 sup.** (saec. XI⁴, northern Italy); ed. Paolo Vaciago, *Glossae biblicae* I, CCCM 189A (Turnhout, 2004), p. 128. The second part of the addition to item 112 is taken from Isidore, *De officiis* I 43; ed. C.M. Lawson, *Isidorus Hispalensis. De ecclesiasticis officiis*, CCSL 113 (Turnhout, 1989). The addition to item 125 shows parallels with an anonymous exposition of the Creed published as text 16 in *Explanationes symboli aevi Carolini*, ed. Susan Keefe, CCCM 254 (Turnhout, 2012), p. 91. Other identifiable sources of additions to items 126-62 not described here include Cassiodorus's *Expositio psalmorum*, Donatus's *Ars maior*, Audax's *Excerpta de Scauro et Palladio*, and other grammatical authors, among whom may be Diomedes.

⁴⁴ A definition of God appearing in Paul the Deacon's epitome follows the excerpt from Ambrosiaster in the second *Quid est Deus* (item 2): *Deus autem dicitur quod ei nihil desit, vel quia omnia commoda hominibus dat, sive melius a Graeco theos quod significat metum, eo quod hominibus et omnibus metus sit.* Paul prepared the epitome of Festus for Charlemagne at Monte Cassino around 781 or 786. The earliest history of this work and the identified manuscripts are discussed in Clare Woods, "A Contribution to the King's Library: Paul the Deacon's Epitome and its Carolingian Context," in *Verrius, Festus, and Paul: lexicography, scholarship, and society* (2011), ed. Fay Glinister, Clare Woods, J. A. North and M. H. Crawford, Bulletin of the Institute of Classical Studies of the University of London. Supplementary papers 93 (London, 2007), 109–36. If not the Paul's epitome, we may assume that this definition comes directly from Festus's *De verborum significatu*, a source not less exotic than the epitome.

⁴⁵ Reg. lat. 1587, fol. 53r: Liber a legendo vel a liberando et filius liber dicitur pro eo quod a peccatis nos liberat, sicut dicit Apostolus: "Si vos Filius liberaverit, tunc liberi eritis." Et dicitur liber ad generandum, codex ad recondendum, volumen ad revolvendum. Mundus de ornatu accepit nomen. The definitions of liber (child) and mundus, but not of liber (book), codex, and volumen, appear in the excerpt from the Chronica sancti Hieronymi following the 74-question version of the Collectio unde in the super-collection; Gorman, "The Carolingian Miscellany of Exegetical Texts," p. 352.

Bibliothèque municipale, MS 1433 (saec. XII², prov.: Clairvaux) transmits on fols. 56v-57v a sequence of 16 questions taken from the 162-question version of the *Collectio unde* as *Ouaestiones de sacris nominibus*. 46

It is impossible to precisely determine the relationship between the two surviving versions of the Collectio unde. However, the existence of the 162-question version with its uninterrupted sequence of items derived from book IX of the *Etymologiae* reveals the 74-question version to be a reworking of older material. The cutting off of material with *caesar* and *imperator* was doubtlessly a programmatic decision of compilers who followed a set of objectives different from those of the original compilers of their source. This does not necessarily mean that this source was the 162-question version or that this long version existed before 800 in the form in which it survives in **Montecassino 29**. In particular, the presence of twenty items from De officiis (items 61-80 in the 162-question version) inserted into the part of the 162-question version that corresponds to the 74-question version suggests that the Montecassino manuscript, too, contains a reworking of the *Collectio unde*.⁴⁷ It can be argued that other items of the 162 questions in **Montecassino 29** may have been reshuffled. Given that the collection follows the structure of the *Etymologiae*, it can be assumed that it originally opened with questions taken from books I-V, which are currently placed at the end of the 162-question version. Only then was it followed by questions taken from books VI, VII, VIII, and IX. Indeed, the oldest version of the Collectio unde was perhaps a question-and-answer epitome of the first nine books of the Etymologiae interspersed with some additional miscellaneous material rather than an

.

⁴⁶ The Troyes manuscript is textually closely related to **Montecassino 29** and may have been copied from this codex, perhaps at Monte Cassino; see Lukas Dorfbauer, "Ein neuer Textzeuge des wisigotischen Genesiskommentars "Intexuimus": Exzerpte im Codex Monte Cassino, Bibl. Abb. 187," *Revue d'études augustiniennes et patristiques* 57 (2011), 357–69, note 27 at pp. 366–67.
⁴⁷ The twenty questions corresponding to *Etym.* VI 19.1-59, which currently appear between two following questions taken from book VIII, belong properly in the gap between items 110 (*Etym.* VI 18.12) and 111 (*Etym.* VI 19.59). The questions 80 and 111, *Unde dicta est oratio*, are identical. They look like duplicates arising from an incident of copying, strengthening the impression that the questions corresponding to *Etym.* VI 19.1-59 are dislocated.

instructional text for priests or monks. This epitome in a question-and-answer form, originating before the year 800, was taken and repurposed by several groups of compilers, one working close to the Carolingian court, and another perhaps in Italy. It is tempting to see the common denominator of both the 74-question and the 162-question versions of the *Collectio unde* as Monte Cassino, which had the necessary links to both the Carolingian court and central Italy and would fit other clues strewn through the text (e.g. the monastic background of the original compilers and the range of source texts exploited for the collection⁴⁸).

The *Collectio unde* remains unedited and unstudied beyond the brief treatment in Michael Gorman's 2002 article.⁴⁹

Pauca de fide catholica et de officiiis ecclesiasticis

Three manuscripts from the ninth century, **Wolfenbüttel**, **Herzog August Bibliothek**, **MS Helmst. 532** (ca. 820, Salzburg), **Monza**, **Biblioteca capitolare**, **MS e-14/127** (saec. IX^{3/4}, northern Italy), and **Montpellier**, **Bibliothèque interuniversitaire**, **MS H 387** (saec. IX^{3/4}, northern France [?]), and one manuscript from the tenth century, **London**, **British Library**, **MS Royal 8 C III** (saec. X^{4/4}, south-eastern England), transmit in a slightly different order the same collection of *interrogationes et responsiones* with a catechetic tone partially drawn from the

_

⁴⁸ If Paul's epitome of Festus is to be counted among the sources of this original compilation, rather than considered a later addition to the 162-question version, the compilers would have had access to it, remarkably, during the lifetime of its author, when few copies would have existed, perhaps no other than the dedicatory copy in Charlemagne's library and Paul's draft kept at Monte Cassino. Crucially, some of the other *rara* among the sources of the 162-question version, such as Audax and Diomedes, were also poorly known beyond the Carolingian court and Monte Cassino before 800.

⁴⁹ Gorman, "The Carolingian Miscellany of Exegetical Texts."

Etymologiae. 50 A fifth incomplete witness survives from the twelfth century. 51 In the Wolfenbüttel manuscript, this collection is called Pauca de fide catholica et de officiis ecclesiasticis. In the Montpellier manuscript, we encounter the title Interrogationes antequam ad sacros ordines aliquis accedit. No title appears in the Monza and the London manuscripts. I shall use the title in the oldest manuscript to refer to the collection in this paper.

Pauca de fide catholica can be described based on the Monza and London manuscripts, which contain a version of this collection consisting of 17 pairs of *interrogationes* and *responsiones* as follows:

#	title in the manuscript (order)	content	topic
1-2	(Quid est symbolum, 1)	exposition of the Creed ⁵²	Creed
3	Ordo episcoporum in quot partes	Etym. VII 12.4-13	bishops
	dividitur (3)		
4-	Quid continetur in symbolum (4)	exposition of the Creed ⁵³	Creed
10			
11	Cur dicitur opus illorum qui in	Etym. VI 19.1 ⁵⁴	officium
	ecclesia ministrant officium (11)		

⁵⁰ The Wolfenbüttel manuscript is described in Otto von Heinemann, Die Helmstedter Handschriften. Bd. 2: Cod. Guelf. 501 bis 1000 Helmst. (Wolfenbüttel, 1886), pp. 200-23. A new description was prepared for the Handschriftenportal by Bertram Lesser in 2018, at: https://alpha.handschriftenportal.de/search?hspobjectid=HSP-55201e7c-3b1e-35ca-a4fa-2bfdae69c91d. The Monza manuscripts is described in Annalisa Belloni and Mirella Ferrari, La biblioteca capitolare di Monza, Medioevo e umanesimo 21 (Padova, 1974), pp. 88–92. The Montpellier manuscript is described in Keefe, Water and the Word, 2:38–40; and Rhijn, Leading the Way to Heaven, pp. 175-178. The London manuscript is described in George F. Warner and Julius P. Gilson, Catalogue of Western Manuscripts in the Old Royal and King's Collections, 4 vols. (London: British Museum, 1921), 1:229; and online at: http://www.bl.uk/manuscripts/FullDisplay.aspx?ref=Royal MS 8 C III.

⁵¹ This is Leipzig, Universitätsbibliotheek, MS 225 with a provenance in the Cistercian abbey of Altzelle by Nossen, which contains only the first 10 interrogationes and responsiones of the collection. The manuscript is described in Rudolf Helssig, Katalog der lateinischen und deutschen Handschriften der Universitäts-Bibliothek zu Leipzig. Bd.1: Die theologischen Handschriften, Katalog der Handschriften der Universitäts-Bibliothek zu Leipzig 4.1.1 (Leipzig, 1926).

⁵² This anonymous exposition is described as text 284 in Keefe, A Catalogue of Works Pertaining to the Explanation of the Creed, p. 160. The first *responsio* of this exposition is provided by *Etym.* VI 19.57. ⁵³ This is a continuation of text 284 described by Keefe (see the previous footnote).

⁵⁴ The question Cur dicitur opus illorum qui in ecclesia ministrant officium and the opening of the responsio 11, but not the entire item, also appears on p. 259 of St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 614 (St. Gall) as a tenth-century addition. A preceding addition on

12	Quae sunt sacramenta ecclesiae (12)	Etym. VI 19.39-40 + Etym. VI	sacraments
		19.42	
13-	Baptismum quid est (13)	Etym. VI 19.43 + Etym. VI 19.46 +	baptism
14		Etym. VI 19.54 ⁵⁵	
15-	Quid dicis esse sacrificium (15)	Etym. VI 19.38 + anonymous text ⁵⁶	mass
16			
17	Quot et quibus modis constat	baptismal instruction ⁵⁷	baptism
	officium baptismatis. Et quid prius		
	agere debet ille qui baptizat (17)		

The Wolfenbüttel manuscript lacks items 15-17. The Montpellier manuscript places item 3 before items 1-2. As items 4-10 represent a continuation of items 1-2, the order of material in this manuscript seems to be most authentic, which is also suggested by the fact that it is the only manuscript containing a question before item 1. Indeed, the Wolfenbüttel manuscript contains a cross-shaped tie mark copied from its exemplar that indicates that item 3 ended between items 2 and 4 by mistake. Due to this copying error and the omission of the question of item 1, the texts of the Wolfenbüttel, Monza, and London manuscripts are mutually related, while the text of the Montpellier manuscript represents an unaffected textual branch.⁵⁸ Given the presence of the tie

the same page of the St. Gall manuscripts paraphrases *Etym*. VII 12 on bishops, but it is not identical with item 3 of *Pauca de fide catholica*. See Andrieu, *Les ordines romani*, 1:346.

⁵⁵ This sequence of excerpts from the *Etymologiae* was also edited on the basis of the manuscripts of the *Pauca de fide catholica* as text 39 in Keefe, *Water and the Word*, 2:538.

⁵⁶ Montpellier MS 387, fol. 55r (to item 16, *Cur cottidie offertur corpus Christi et sanguis in ecclesia quando canimus missam*): *Idcirco cottidie offertur quia peccamus cotidiae, "Septies enim iustus cadit in die'; vel ne oblivioni passio Christi traderetur, ipse enim dicit: "Quotiescumque feceritis, in meam commemorationem facitis'; vel significat diem iuditii in ecclesia discernentem bonos et malos.* This text resembles the anonymous preface to the mass commentary *Ordinis totius missae expositio prior* printed by Hanssens; see Roger Reynolds, "Unity and Diversity in Carolingian Canon Law Collections: The Case of the 'Collectio Hibernensis' and Its Derivatives," in *Law and Liturgy in the Latin Church, 5th - 12th Century*, ed. Uta-Renate Blumenthal (Washington, D.C., 1983), pp. 99–135, at 125–27.

⁵⁷ This baptismal instruction was edited on the basis of the manuscripts of the *Pauca de fide catholica* as text 40 in Keefe, *Water and the Word*, 2:539–41.

⁵⁸ The Leipzig manuscript contains the same error as the Wolfenbüttel, Monza, and London manuscripts.

mark in it, the exemplar of the Wolfenbüttel manuscript may have been the source of the error and thus the parent of all manuscripts sharing it. As the Wolfenbüttel manuscript can be dated to ca. 820, this error-bearing codex must be older, and since the Montpellier manuscript represents an error-free form of the collection, we can infer that there was at least one even older codex, the minimal required common ancestor of all surviving manuscripts.

While we lack a firm *terminus post quem*, the *Pauca de fide catholica* seems, therefore, to have been compiled at the latest around the same time as *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris* and the shorter version of the *Collectio unde*. The diffusion range of the collection is also similarly wide, including southern Germany (the Wolfenbüttel manuscript), northern France (the Montpellier manuscript), northern Italy (the Monza manuscript), and, by the tenth century, England (the London manuscript). ⁵⁹ We do not get a sense of where the collection may have originated. Nevertheless, as the Wolfenbüttel manuscript was copied during the episcopacy of Arn of Salzburg (785 – 821), a friend of Alcuin, who had ties to St. Amand and was well connected to the Carolingian court, ⁶⁰ and as the Montpellier manuscript contains an error-free version that seems to be older than the version available in other regions, it is tempting to situate the compilation of *Pauca de fide catholica* to northern France, where, as we have seen, other collections analysed in this paper originated.

As in the case of these other collections, *Pauca de fide catholica* combines snippets from the *Etymologiae* discussing bishops, the Creed, the mass, and baptism with anonymous texts on the Creed, baptism, and the mass. The Isidorean material in *Pauca de fide catholica* comes from

⁵⁹ The English manuscript is almost certainly a copy of an earlier Frankish codex, see Donald A. Bullough, "Roman Books and Carolingian Renovatio," *Studies in Church History* 14 (1977), 23–50, at p. 49.

⁶⁰ See Bernhard Bischoff, *Die Südostdeutschen Schreibschulen und Bibliotheken in der Karolingerzeit. II: Die Vorwiegend österreichischen Diözesen.*, 2 vols. (Wiesbaden, 1980), 2:61–64; and Roger E. Reynolds, "Canon Law Collections in Early Ninth-Century Salzburg," in *Proceedings of the Fifth International Congress of Medieval Canon Law*, ed. Stephan Kuttner and Kenneth Pennigton, Monumenta Iuris Canonici 6 (Vatican City, 1980), pp. 15–34, at 17–18 and 27.

Etym. VI 19 (*De officiis*) and Etym. VII 12 (*De clericis*), the two chapters of books VI and VII most relevant to clerical education. While the only members of the clergy directly discussed in *Pauca de fide catholica* are bishops, the title of the collection in the Montpellier manuscript suggests that it was interpreted at least in one case as an examination of those entering the clerical orders. Susan Keefe edited three segments of the collection dealing with the Creed (items 1-2 with 4-10) and baptism (items 13-14, and 17) as self-standing entities. We should rightfully suspect that *Pauca de fide catholica*, just like *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris*, is assembled from pre-extant components circulating independently in the early Middle Ages.

Nevertheless, at least one of Keefe's texts (corresponding to items 13-14) should be considered a mirage as a self-sufficient entity as it makes sense only in the context of *Pauca de fide catholica* as one in a sequence of several excerpts from *Etym*. VI 19. The baptismal instruction (item 17) survives only in the context of this collection. The exposition of the Creed (items 1-2 and 4-10) is attested on its own, however only in manuscripts more recent than *Pauca de fide catholica*.

In the Monza and the Montpellier manuscripts, *Pauca de fide catholica* is preceded by another exposition of the Creed with the *incipit De eadem fide catholica ad interrogandum*.⁶⁴ This exposition of the Creed, dated by its editor to ca. 800-830, can be found in several manuscripts as a self-standing text.⁶⁵ It likely became attached to *Pauca de fide catholica* in a manner similar to

⁶¹ Compare with Rhijn, *Leading the Way to Heaven*, p. 176. With pages measuring only 135 x 112 mm, this is obviously another personal notebook. Bernhard Bischoff even calls it a 'Taschencodex zu persönlichem Gebrauch'; Bischoff, *Katalog der festländischen Handschriften des neunten Jahrhunderts (mit Ausnahme der wisigotischen) <i>II: Laon-Paderborn*, ed. Birgit Ebersperger, Veröffentlichungen der Kommission für die Herausgabe der mittelalterlichen Bibliothekskataloge Deutschlands und der Schweiz (Wiesbaden, 2004), n. 2868.

⁶² See footnotes 52, 55, and 57.

⁶³ I found it in Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Reg. lat. 407 (saec. IX^{med.} or IX^{3/4}, connection with St. Gall), Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Ott. lat. 122 (saec. XI), and Milan, Biblioteca Ambrosiana, MS M 79 sup. (saec. XI⁴, northern Italy).

⁶⁴ This exposition is described as text 295 in Keefe, *A Catalogue of Works Pertaining to the Explanation of the Creed*, p. 163. In the Montpellier codex, two other *expositiones fidei* and one exposition of the Lord's Prayer separate the two entities, i.e. it does not directly precede *Pauca de fide catholica*.

⁶⁵ See Wolfram Kinzig, *Neue Texte und Studien zu den antiken und frühmittelalterlichen Glaubensbekenntnissen*, Arbeiten zur Kirchengeschichte 132 (Berlin, 2017), pp. 141–44. Two of the witnesses of the self-standing version, **Einsiedeln, Stiftsbibliothek**,

how, as we have already seen, other collections attracted new components or became incorporated into larger and more complex super-collections.

The text of the collection was published from the Monza manuscript in 1909 by Heinrich Brewer. 66 Apart from the segments edited by Keefe, the collection has never been studied as a whole.

The interrogationes et responsiones embedded in the Collectio Sangermanensis

On its first 104 folia, manuscript **Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS lat. 12444** (saec. VIII/IX, Fleury [?], prov.: Corbie) preserves a rich compilation of excerpts from canon law and the Church Fathers dealing in the order of appearance, with councils and bishops, priests and other clerics, monks and nuns, church buildings and baptism, liturgical vestments and vessels, sacraments, mass and liturgical feasts, widows, martyrs, sinners and sin, penance, and marriage. This collection suitable for the execution of episcopal duties was edited in 2004 as *Collectio Sangermanensis XXI titulorum* because the Parisian manuscript divided it into 21 thematic *capitula*. For our purposes, it is relevant that among the building blocks of the *Collectio Sangermanensis*, we also find a sequence of *interrogationes* and *responsiones* and that these were predominantly taken from Isidore's *Etymologiae* and *De officiis*. 8

MS 27 (saec. $IX^{2/3}$, Switzerland or northern Italy) and Verdun, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 27 (saec. $IX^{2/3}$, eastern France) are of the same age as the Monza and the Montpellier manuscripts.

⁶⁶ Heinrich Brewer, *Das sogenannte Athanasische Glaubensbekenntnis - ein Werk des heiligen Ambrosius*, Forschungen zur Christlichen Literatur- und Dogmengeschichte 9 (Paderborn, 1909), pp. 186–89.

⁶⁷ See Michael Stadelmaier, *Die Collectio Sangermanensis XXI titulorum: eine systematische Kanonessammlung der frühen Karolingerzeit*, Freiburger Beiträge zur mittelalterlichen Geschichte 16 (Frankfurt am Main, 2004).

⁶⁸ As they appear at the beginning of each *capitulum* and at the beginnings of notable topical breaks within the *capitula*, these question-and-answer sections create an impression of a separate source utilized by the compilers of the *Collectio Sangermanensis*. If there existed such a text, it may have been very well a collection compiled for the benefit of priests or bishops. However, we don't have any independent trace of it.

While the *Collectio Sangermanensis* survives completely only in the Parisian codex, parts of the same collection were identified in another seven manuscripts, including four codices featuring a selection corresponding principally to the *interrogationes* and *responsiones*. The two substantial witnesses of the latter type are **Albi, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 38bis** (ca. 813 [?], southern France, prov.: Albi), which contains *interrogationes* and *responsiones* from *capitula* 1-9 of the collection preserved in **Paris lat. 12444**, and **London, British Library, MS Harley 3034** (saec. IX^{1/4} [?], Rhine area, perhaps Lorsch or the area of Mainz), which transmits questions and answers corresponding to *capitula* 12-16 of the Parisian codex.⁶⁹ As these two manuscripts contain segments of the *Collectio Sangermanensis* treating topics most relevant to priests, and since they lack most of the material that would be relevant only to a bishop, rather than being peculiar excerpts from the *Collectio*, these two shorter collections of Isidorean *interrogationes et responsiones* can be considered texts intended for the education and use of clerics. This can be likewise gleaned from the following overview of the contents of **Albi 38bis** and **Harley 3034**:

A	Albi	CS	Content	topic

⁶⁹ Up-to-date descriptions of the contents of the two manuscripts appear in Stadelmaier, *Die Collectio Sangermanensis*, pp. 86–89 and 91–93. Both manuscripts were variously dated to anywhere between the first and the third quarter of the ninth century. Albi 38bis was assigned to the third quarter of the ninth century by Bischoff, while Stadelmaier and Hubert Mordek prefer a slightly earlier date to mid-ninth century and Matthieu Desachy dates it on the basis of a calendar to ca. 813, see Bernhard Bischoff, Katalog der festländischen Handschriften des neunten Jahrhunderts (mit Ausnahme der wisigotischen). I: Aachen-Lambach, ed. Birgit Ebersperger, Veröffentlichungen der Kommission für die Herausgabe der mittelalterlichen Bibliothekskataloge Deutschlands und der Schweiz (Wiesbaden, 1998), n. 20; Hubert Mordek, Kirchenrecht und Reform im Frankenreich. Die Collectio Vetus Gallica, die älteste systematische Kanonessammlung des fränkischen Gallien, Beiträge zur Geschichte und Quellenkunde des Mittelalters 1 (Sigmaringen, 1975), pp. 269-70; and Le scriptorium d'Albi. Les manuscrits de la cathédrale Sainte-Cécile (VIIe-XIIe siècle), ed. Matthieu Desachy, Trésors écrits albigeois 2 (Rodez, 2007), pp. 38-41. As for the Harley manuscript, Bischoff dated it to saec. IX^{1-2/4}, while the digital catalogue description of the British Library places it more firmly into the first quarter of the ninth century; compare Bernhard Bischoff, Katalog der festländischen Handschriften des neunten Jahrhunderts (mit Ausnahme der wisigotischen). II: Laon-Paderborn, Veröffentlichungen der Kommission für die Herausgabe der mittelalterlichen Bibliothekskataloge Deutschlands und der Schweiz (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2004), http://www.bl.uk/manuscripts/FullDisplay.aspx?ref=Harley MS 3034 (accessed on 28/02/2022).

38v-	I.1-2	Etym. VI 16	councils
39v			
39v-	I.3	Collectio canonum Hibernensis I 1 + Etym. VII 12.4-7	bishops
39v			
39v-	II.1 + 3	Etym. VII 12.16-19 + Collectio canonum Hibernensis 2.1a-b	priests
40v		+ Collectio canonum Hibernensis 2.5a + 7-11 + Eucherius,	
		Instructiones I 35 + John Cassian, Collationes 21.3 +	
		unidentified text ⁷⁰	
40v	III.1	Etym. VII 12.22	deacons
41r	IV.1	Etym. VII 12.23 + De officiis II 10.1-2	subdeacons
41r	V.1 + 3	Etym. VII 12.24-25 + Collectio canonum Hibernensis 5.1	lectors
41r	VI.1-2	Etym. VII 12.31 + Collectio canonum Hibernensis 6.1	exorcists
41r	VII.1	Etym. VII 12.32-33 + De officiis II 15.1	ostiaries
41r-	VIII.1	Etym. VII 12.29-30	acolytes
41v			
41v	VIII.3-4	Collectio canonum Hibernensis 8.1-2	clerical
			grades
41v	VIII.5-6	Etym. VII 12.24 + Collectio canonum Hibernensis 9.2a +	psalmists and
		Etym. VII 12.26-28	cantors
42r	IX.1	Etym. VII 12.1	clerics

⁷⁰ See Stadelmaier, *Die Collectio Sangermanensis*, p. 168.

Harley	CS	content	topic
1r-5r	XII.1-11	Etym. VIII 1 + Etym. XV 4.5-7, 11, 4, 12, 14-17 + Etym.	church
		XV 7.1-5, 7-9, 6 + Etym. XV 8.1-2, 4-6, 8-9, 14-15, 13, 10-	buildings
		11, 7 + Etym. XIX 4.1 + Etym. XX 10.4-5, 3, 2, 8, 6-7 +	
		Etym. XIX 16.1-19.17.17 + Etym. XV 4.9-10	
5r-6r	XII.10-	Etym. VI 19.43-49 + a paraphrase of <i>De officiis</i> II 25.7-9 ⁷¹	baptism
	11 + 19-	+ Etym. VI 19.50 + De officiis II 26.1-2 + Etym. XVII	
	21	8.14-16	
6r	XIII.1-5	Etym. XIX 22.9, 24 + Etym. XIX 24.17	liturgical
			vestments
6v	XIV.1-3	Etym. XX 4.10 + Etym. XX 5.5, 3 + Etym. XIX 26.7	liturgical
			vessels
6v-8r	XV.1-5	Etym. VI 19.5-6, 24 + De officiis I 14.1 + Etym. VI 19.25-	sacraments
		35, 38 + <i>De officiis</i> I 18.1-9	
8r-8v	XVI.1	Etym. VI 19.4 + De officiis I 15.1-5 + Etym. XV 5.1 +	mass
		Libellus responsionum Gregorii papae, cap. 2	
8v-10r	XVI.2-	Etym. VI 18.1-2 + De officiis I 26.3 + De officiis I 27.1 +	liturgical
	15	De officiis I 28.1-3 + De officiis I 29.1-2 + De officiis I	feasts
		30.1 + De officiis I 31.1-2 + De officiis I 32.1-8 +	
		Gennadius of Marseilles, Liber ecclesiasticorum dogmatum	
		53 + De officiis I 33.1 + De officiis I 34.1, 6 + De officiis I	

⁷¹ This paraphrase was edited on the basis of the *Collectio Sangermanensis* separately in Keefe, *Water and the Word*, 2:334–35.

$24.1-2 + unidentified text^{72} + John the Cassian, De$
institutis coenobiorum II.18 + De officiis I 43.2 + Statuta
ecclesiae antiqua 77 + De officiis I 35.1-2 + De officiis I
19.1 + De officiis I 20.1 + De officiis I 21.1 + De officiis I
22.1-3 + De officiis I 23.1

The collection in the Albi manuscript deals with clerical grades, while the Harley manuscript covers the mass, baptism, the sacraments, and feasts, including Easter and Sunday, that is the topics treated in the *Collectio Sangermanensis* most likely to be interesting to priests. The canon law material and material from sources other than the *Etymologiae* and *De officiis* are mostly absent. However, as far as it was retained, it concerns precisely the kinds of subject matter that are well-represented in texts intended for the education and use of priests. In the Albi manuscript, these are the ones dealing with priests (fols. 39v-40v) and providing an overview of clerical grades (fol. 41v), and in the Harley manuscript, these are the sections dedicated to baptism (fols. 5r-6r), the mass (fols. 8r-8v), and the celebration of Sunday (fol. 8v).

The didactic purpose is more prominent in both the Albi and Harley collections than in the *Collectio Sangermanensis*. In the latter, the question-and-answer sections seem to be a vestige of an older source text or a progressively abandoned redactional decision, as the questions abound at the beginning and thin down towards the end of **Paris lat. 12444**. However, to the compilers of the two shorter collections, it was an essential feature, as they added questions to material that does not have a question-and-answer form in the *Collectio Sangermanensis*.⁷³ The Harley

⁷² This short text was published by Maassen as a special form of canon 20 of the council of Nicaea based on the label in **Paris lat. 12444**; Maassen, *Geschichte der Quellen und der Literatur des Canonischen Rechts im Abendlande bis zum Ausgange des Mittelalters I: Die Rechtssammlungen bis zur Mitte des 9. Jahrhunderts* (Graz, 1870), p. 924. However, it is not attested as a canon elsewhere than in this manuscript. In the Harley manuscript, it simply follows the text of *De officiis*.

⁷³ This transformation did not concern only material drawn from the *Etymologiae* and *De officiis*, which had been left untouched in the *Collectio*, but also other sources, which had never been intended to be cast in the form of questions and answers.

collection even presents the material as a dialogue between a teacher (*magister*) and a student (*discipulus*), confirming that its compilers intended it to be an educational instrument.

The fragmentary preservation of manuscripts and texts allow us to say little about the textual history of the two collections of Isidorean interrogationes et responsiones. Their relationship with the *Collectio Sangermanensis* as preserved in **Paris lat. 12444** is more complicated than imagined by the *Collectio*'s editor, who thought them to be derivative and secondary.⁷⁴ Some of the non-Isidorean sources retained in the Albi and the Harley collections are identical with the sources exploited by the compilers of the Collectio Sangermanensis, as is to be expected if Albi **38bis** and **Harley 3034** contained a selection excerpted from the *Collectio*. ⁷⁵ However, both shorter texts also contain notable additions and variant readings not present in Paris lat. 12444 and other witnesses of the Collectio Sangermanensis, suggesting that they stem from a different version or redaction of the shared Isidorean layer. ⁷⁶ We should perhaps imagine that the collections in Albi 38bis and Harley 3034 descend from an earlier draft or redaction of the Collectio. We can safely assume that such a major intellectual enterprise involved a draft or two, for example, if its compilers were also the ones who selected excerpts from the Etymologiae and De officiis and converted them into the form of questions and answers. Such draft or drafts may have undergone several stages of redactional changes and accretion of new material, which

⁷⁴ Stadelmaier, *Die Collectio Sangermanensis*, pp. 108–10.

⁷⁵ In the Albi manuscript, many *responsiones* are drawn from the *Collectio canonum Hibernensis*, while in the Harley manuscript, we find a *responsum* from the letters of Gregory the Great to Augustine of Canterbury, and excerpts from Gennadius of Marseilles and the *Statuta ecclesiae antiqua*.

⁷⁶ Most notably, the etymology of sacerdos (II.1) in **Albi 38bis** (fol. 39v) reads: Sacerdos nomen conpositum est ex sacer et dux, et dictus sacerdos quasi sacrum dans. Sicut enim rex a regendo, ita sacerdos a sanctificando vocatus est; while **Paris lat. 12444** (fol. 18r) reads: Sacerdos nomen conpositum est. INT. Ex quibus linguis. RES. Grega et latina, et dictus sacerdos quasi sacrum dans. Sicut enim rex recta agendo, ita sacerdos ad sanctificando vocatus est. Compare with Etym. VII 12.17: Sacerdos autem nomen habet conpositum ex Graeco et Latino, quasi sacrum dans; sicut enim rex a regendo, ita sacerdos a sacrificando vocatus est. Not only is it the case that the definition in the Albi manuscript could not be derived from the text version represented by the Collectio Sangermanensis, but it also represents a lectio dificilior because of its non-Isidorean explanation of the name sacerdos. In the Harley manuscript, similarly, the section on chrism (XII.20) on fol. 5v opens with an interrogatio taken from Etym. VI 19.50, which is missing from **Paris lat. 12444** and the section De sollempnitatibus (XVI.14) on fol. 10r does not speak about apostoli but sancti.

would ideally explain the combination of textual traits of the Albi and Harley collections. Given the conditions of the early Middle Ages, it is likely that once the final product was brought forth, the older draft or drafts were not discarded but shelved as potentially useful in the future or even put immediately to suitable use. ⁷⁷ Indeed, while the *Collectio Sangermanensis* is primarily a collection for the use of a bishop with a heavy focus on canon law, the two collections in **Albi 38bis** and **Harley 3034** are much humbler instructional texts for priests drawn from an available pool of useful material. The two collections of *interrogationes* and *responsiones* can thus be considered an example of appropriation of material not originally intended for the education of priests, like the *Collectio unde*. ⁷⁸

While **Harley 3034** cannot be classified based on its contents and dimensions as a priests' handbook, ⁷⁹ this can be said about **Albi 38bis** and **Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Pal. lat. 485** (saec. IX^{3/4}, Lorsch), which contains the beginning of the collection in **Harley 3034**. ⁸⁰ In the latter case, we may be looking at a pair consisting of a model book and instruction-readers prepared on its basis, a scenario pointing to an instructional context. ⁸¹

Unfortunately, we are left in the dark about so many aspects of the transmission history of the Albi and the Harley collection that we cannot be sure whether they contain two discrete parts of a larger intermediary, such as a hypothetical large collection of *interrogationes et responsiones*

⁷⁷ A notable example of such a second life of drafts of a known text concerns Cassiodorus's *Institutiones*; see Louis Holtz, "Quelques aspects de la tradition et de la diffusion des *Institutiones*," in *Flavio Magno Aurelio Cassiodoro. Atti della settimana di Studi (Cosenza - Squillace 19 - 24 settembre 1983*), ed. Sandro Leanza (Squillace, 1984), pp. 281–312; and Ilaria Morresi, "Le redazioni PhyDelta delle 'Institutiones' di Cassiodoro: considerazioni preliminari all'edizione critica," *Filologia mediolatina. Rivista della Fondazione Ezio Franceschini* 25 (2018), 63–86.

⁷⁸ Compare with Stadelmaier, *Die Collectio Sangermanensis*, p. 81.

⁷⁹ Apart from the sequence of the *interrogationes et responsiones* related to the *Collectio Sangermanensis*, this manuscript contains Augustine's *Enchiridion* (fols. 11v-58r), and works of Candidus-Wizo (fols. 58v-96v). Its pages measure 310 x 207 mm, making it substantially larger than other manuscripts transmitting these *interrogationes et responsiones*.

⁸⁰ Apart from Paxton's article (see footnote 16), **Pal. lat. 485** is also described as a handbook for priests in Patzold, "Correctio an der Basis," p. 250; and Rhijn, *Leading the Way to Heaven*, pp. 70–71. Patzold classifies **Albi 38bis** as a priest's handbook, while van Rhijn rather sees it as a "pastoral compendium." See Patzold, "Correctio an der Basis," p. 249; Rhijn, *Leading the Way to Heaven*, pp. 241–42. The former has dimensions of 255 x 185 mm, while the pages of the latter measures 228-240 x 160-175 mm. ⁸¹ On model books and instruction-readers see Susan Keefe, *Water and the Word*, 1:22–26.

paralleling more or all of the twenty-one *capitula* of the *Collectio Sangermanensis*, or they are two independent entities which merely happen to reflect similar concerns. Intriguingly, the Albi manuscript was copied in southern France and the Harley manuscript in the Rhine valley, perhaps in Lorsch or the area of Mainz, while the *Collectio Sangermanensis* can be connected with Corbie. 82 We, thus, have evidence for a rapid and broad diffusion, while lacking a single witness from the region where we should assume the core layer of the compilation originated, namely northern France - a pattern that should not come as a surprise since we observed it in the case of *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris* as well. The *Collectio Sangermanensis* seems to have been completed in the second half of the eighth century, perhaps in its last decades. 83 **Albi** 38bis and Harley 3034, which may date to the first quarter of the ninth century, thus provide us with a narrow time window for the compilation of the two collections of Isidorean *interrogationes et responsiones*.

The collections of *interrogationes et responsiones* in the Albi and Harley manuscripts have not been studied apart from Michael Stadelmaier. He studied them for his edition of the *Collectio Sangermanensis*.⁸⁴

Isidorean collections for priests in a broader context

The four Isidorean collections for priests share many similarities: their region and period of origin, a complex textual history involving multiple text versions and several groups of compilers and appropriators, and a rapid diffusion but a paltry survival rate. All four seem to

⁸² Stadelmaier, Die Collectio Sangermanensis, p. 69.

⁸³ Stadelmaier, Die Collectio Sangermanensis, pp. 67–68.

⁸⁴ A brief note about **Harley 3034** appears in Carmen Codoñer Merino, "Transmisión y recepción de las 'Etimologías'," in *Estudios de latín medieval hispánico*. *Actas del V Congreso Internacional de Latín Medieval Hispánico*, ed. José Martínez Gázquez, Óscar de la Cruz Palma, and Cándida Ferrero Hernández (Florence, 2011), pp. 5–26, at 21.

have been compiled in the timeframe spanning the last decades of the eighth and the first decades of the ninth centuries, precisely the period that witnessed a significant outburst of creative and intellectual activity in the Carolingian empire resulting in the production and compilation of many new texts. Two of them seem to have been compiled at or under the direct influence of the Carolingian court, while one has its ultimate point of origin in Corbie, an important royal monastery closely involved in courtly policies. *Pauca de fide catholica* probably also originated in northern France, the heartland of Carolingian power. The four collections can be placed in the context of Carolingian *correctio*, the efforts of educating clergy and shepherding the lay population to salvation. Indeed, they should be considered cognates of the anonymous catechetic texts documented by Keefe and others.

While it is now recognised that *correctio* was not a top-down program orchestrated from the Carolingian court, but rather a much more decentralised and heterogeneous undertaking involving many local actors, ⁸⁸ the two most widely attested Isidorean collections lead us, nevertheless, close to the Carolingian court and its agendas. The extent of their preservation and diffusion tells us that we are not looking at just any catechetical collections compiled in the

⁸⁵ This outburst was well documented for grammatical texts in Vivien A. Law, "The Transmission of Early Medieval Elementary Grammars: A Case Study in Explanation," in *Formative Stages of Classical Traditions: Latin Texts from Antiquity to the Renaissance; Proceedings of a Conference Held at Erice, 16-22 October 1993, as the 6th Course of International School for the Study of Written Records*, ed. Oronzo Pecere and Michael D. Reeve, Biblioteca del Centro per il Collegamento degli studi medievali e umanistici in Umbria 15 (Spoleto, 1995), pp. 239–61; and Elizabeth Pitkin Archibald, "Methods and Meaning of Basic Education in Carolingian Europe," (unpublished Ph.D. diss., Yale University, 2010), pp. 165–66. Compare with Rhijn, "'Ut missarum preces bene intellegant," p. 8.

⁸⁶ On Carolingian correctio, see in particular Keefe, Water and the Word, 1; Carine van Rhijn, Shepherds of the Lord: Priests and Episcopal Statutes in the Carolingian Period, Cultural Encounters in Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages 6 (Turnhout, 2007); Patzold, "Correctio an der Basis'; Carine van Rhijn, "Royal Politics in Small Worlds. Local Priests and the Implementation of Carolingian Correctio," in Kleine Welten. Ländliche Gesellschaften Im Karolingerreich, ed. Thomas Kohl, Steffen Patzold, and Bernhard Zeller, Vorträge Und Forschungen 87 (Ostfildern, 2019), pp. 237–52.

⁸⁷ The essential studies include Keefe, *Water and the Word* on texts dealing with baptismal instruction; Susan Keefe, *Explanationes symboli aevi Carolini*, CCCM 254 (Turnhout, 2012); and Keefe, *A Catalogue of Works Pertaining to the Explanation of the Creed* on expositions of the Creed; Patzold, "Pater Noster" on expositions of the Lord's Prayer; Rhijn, "'Ut missarum preces bene intellegant," on Mass expositions; and Rhijn, *Leading the Way to Heaven* on several different kind of texts intended for the instruction of Carolingian priests.

⁸⁸ See Keefe, *Water and the Word*, 1:113–14; Rhijn, "Manuscripts for Local Priests," pp. 185–86; and in more general terms Contreni, "The Carolingian Renaissance," pp. 711–12.

Carolingian period. Rather, *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris* and the short version of the *Collectio unde*, each with more than ten surviving witnesses, must have belonged among the more significant products of the reformers' vigour. Already early in the ninth century, we find these texts diffused far from their region of origin. As can be guessed from the subscription of *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris*, they may have been actively dispatched to various locations by those promoting reform, perhaps in the context of church councils, ⁸⁹ and, for this reason, may have enjoyed a larger degree of success than similar texts that were produced for a more modest regional or local consumption. Indeed, while this paper has paid attention to collections preserved in a large number of witnesses, similar Isidorean compilations survive in singular manuscripts. ⁹⁰ They likely provide evidence for more locally conceived collections produced for the education and use of the clergy.

The four well-attested collections display a similar scattered pattern of diffusion. In the cases of *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris* and the *interrogationes et responsiones* related to the *Collectio Sangermanensis*, we lack witnesses from northern France, despite the undeniable evidence for their origin there, while in the case of *Pauca de fide catholica*, such a witness is relatively recent. Only in the case of the short version of the *Collectio unde* do we possess early witnesses from this and other regions of the Carolingian sphere of influence. This fragmentary survival pattern is consistent with a significant loss of manuscripts, which, in turn, can be expected, given that the four collections were primarily transmitted by the most perishable class

⁸⁹ Wolfgang Haubrichs, for example, situates *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris* and its Aachen subscription within the 813 Synod of Mainz; see Wolfgang Haubrichs, *Geschichte der deutschen Literatur von den Anfängen bis zum Beginn der Neuzeit. Bd. 1, 1: Die Anfänge: Versuche volkssprachiger Schriftlichkeit im frühen Mittelalter (ca. 700-1050/60) (Tübingen, 1988), p. 283. This Synod was presided over by Arn of Salzburg, who is also to be connected with Wolfenbüttel 532, the oldest witness of the <i>Pauca de fide catholica*. This manuscript, importantly, contains a letter from Louis the Pious to Arn regarding the 817 council of Aachen and the canons of this council; see Reynolds, "Canon Law Collections," p. 27.

⁹⁰ See the third section of the appendix and also John Contreni's contribution in this volume.

of manuscripts, such as priests' handbooks and similar low-grade books. ⁹¹ Indeed, some of the surviving manuscripts transmitting the four collections were classified as handbooks for priests or priests' instruction-manuals. ⁹² Others were not identified as such but should best be placed into this category or among books to be used by priests and bishops. ⁹³ Nevertheless, the four collections survive principally because they were also copied into higher grade books that represent their most complete witnesses today.

The fragmented pattern of diffusion also reveals something about the heterogeneous character of the reforms. It also implies the unpredictability of the fortunes of collections in those parts of the realm that were most strongly involved in the reforms and therefore where many collections must have been produced in a short span of time in response to the call for *correctio*. We can compare the fate of *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris* and the short version of the *Collectio unde*, the two collections bearing a stamp of the Carolingian court. We find the latter collection in ninth-century manuscripts from all of the principal regions of the Carolingian realm, while *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris* is attested only in the German-speaking areas of the Carolingian empire. Should we assume that it failed to attain wider success, or perhaps a different, more developed resource displaced it? Indeed, it can be noted that this is the only one of the four Isidorean collections described here that was not set into the form of *interrogationes et responsiones*, which may explain why it was pushed out by other texts (and perhaps also indicate its immature and therefore early character). ⁹⁴ As observed for other products of the

⁹¹ See Rhijn, Leading the Way to Heaven, p. 73.

⁹² See the lists in Patzold, "Pater Noster," pp. 249–50; and Rhijn, Leading the Way to Heaven, pp. 246–47.

⁹³ Apart from **St. Gall 879** discussed at its beginning, manuscripts mentioned in this paper that deserve to be placed into this category include **Monza E-14/127** and **Paris lat. 18104**, both featuring catechetic content and discernible as manuscripts for a personal use due to their small size (265 x 170 mm and 192 x 147 mm, respectively). **St. Gall 446**, which contains the *Ordines romani*, Amalarius of Metz's *De caeremoniis baptismi*, and various anonymous texts on baptism, while not a handbook for a priest but rather more likely a depository codex to be used as a model for the production of such handbooks.

⁹⁴ On the question-and-answer format in the early Middle Ages, see Archibald, "Methods and Meaning," pp. 86–125; and Lukas Dorfbauer, "Umformungen patristischer Texte zu Fragen-und-Antworten-Sammlungen: Fundamenta des Unterrichts in frühmittelalterlicher und karolingischer Zeit?," in *Kontinuitäten, Umbrüche, Zäsuren: die Konstruktion von Epochen in Mittelalter*

Carolingian reforms, many texts were compiled in the critical period around the turn of the ninth century, but only a few gained a long-lasting foothold extending beyond the first decades of the ninth century (although some were resurrected in the later Middle Ages). 95

Another commonality of the four collections is their flexible textual nature. As we have seen, each collection survives in several versions, often because their core grew by attracting other similar catechetic material or because they were embedded into large super-collections. The 74-question version of the *Collectio unde* survives only in such a super-collection, while the more successful version of *De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris* is a result of the compounding of several independent texts. Even *Pauca de fide catholica* began to attract other catechetic texts in the second half of the ninth century. At the same time, two of the collections, the 74-question version of the *Collectio unde* and the *interrogationes et responsiones* related to the *Collectio Sangermanensis*, can be shown to have been derived from older compilations that may have been too long and complex for the task of imparting the basics of Christian faith and rites.

Interestingly, these source compilations were not much older than their derivatives, suggesting that at the time of the greatest fervour, an old draft of a canon law compilation for a bishop or an epitome of an encyclopaedia could suddenly find a second use, especially as far as these compilations already possessed desirable features, such as the question-and-answer format.

While priests have only been considered thus far in this paper, it can be noted that some of the collections described here contain textual clues that suggest other potential intended groups of

und früher Neuzeit in interdisziplinärer Sichtung, ed. Gabriele Schichta and Thomas Kühtreiber (Heidelberg, 2016), pp. 173–90. Archibald, in particular, notes that the format reached its peak popularity around 800; Archibald, "Methods and Meaning," pp. 92–

⁹⁵ See Law, "The Transmission of Early Medieval Elementary Grammars," pp. 242-43.

users. The 74-question version of the *Collectio unde*, for example, puts emphasis on monks, possibly because its oldest version was produced for monastic audiences.

Finally, it can be noted that while the collections contain a different assortment of the *Etymologiae*, two of the chapters of Isidore's encyclopaedia recur in all four of them. These are *Etym.* VI 19 (*De officiis*), which covers the mass, baptism, the Eucharist, and the Creed, and *Etym.* VII 12 (*De clericis*), which provides an overview of the clerical grades. Following in the order of frequency in which they appear in the four collections selected for this paper, other prominently represented chapters of Isidore's encyclopaedia are *Etym.* VII 13 (*De monachis*), *Etym.* VII 14 (*De ceteris christianis*) treating laypeople, *Etym.* VIII 1 (*De ecclesia et synagoga*) on the Church, and *Etym.* VII 1.3-17 (*De Deo*) enumerating the ten names of God. We have encountered most of these chapters already in **St. Gall 879**. Due to their abbreviated form consisting of definitions, these chapters, especially *De officiis* and *De clericis*, could be repurposed with little effort as short instructional texts for priests, much like the pre-extant compilations in the question-and-answer format.

Conclusion

Carolingian collections serving the instruction of clergy and manuscripts owned and used by Carolingian priests have been traditionally identified because they contain treatises of Carolingian authors or anonymous compositions dealing with priestly ranks, the Creed, the Lord's prayer, the mass, baptism, and similar topics. However, Carolingian compilers also often drew their material from books VI-VIII of Isidore of Seville's *Etymologiae*, which also treat those subjects. As we have seen in the introduction to this paper, an instructional text covering

topics essential to Carolingian clerical education could have been assembled entirely from snippets of this most important Latin encyclopaedia of the early Middle Ages, containing no conspicuous original textual element that would give away its function. By exploring collections of excerpts from the *Etymologiae*, several previously unknown or barely-studied Carolingian compilations produced for the instruction and use of the clergy can be identified. In fact, the popularity of the *Etymologiae* as a resource for catechetic instruction in the Carolingian environment was such that the presence of material from books VI-VIII of Isidore's encyclopaedia, in particular chapters *De officiis* and *De clericis* and when several of these appear together, may be used as a diagnostic criterion for considering certain compilations as collections that may have been produced in the context of the Carolingian reforms, or particular manuscripts books owned and used by priests.⁹⁶

To make an important final observation about the excerption and repurposing of the *Etymologiae* in the Carolingian period, it is noteworthy that while other authoritative texts could

⁹⁶ Based on this criterion, we can identify three Isidorean compilations that may have been produced with priests in mind but are not included in the overview above because their catechetic function cannot be fully substantiated. One of them is an anonymous collection of a hundred interrogationes et responsiones drawn from Isidore's Differentiae and Etymologiae, called Interrogationes et responsiones de diversis causis in its oldest witness; see María Adelaida Andrés Sanz, "Una reelaboración de textos isidorianos en forma de interrogationes et responsiones," Helmantica: Revista de filología clásica y hebrea 57 (2006), 29-48. None of its eight witnesses is older than the second half of the ninth century. Moreover, the interrogationes et responsiones treat not only God, the Trinity, angels, the Scriptures, and the Church councils, but also the human body, kinship and marriage, history, law, time, soul, free will, and the virtues and vices. This 100-question collection survives embedded in a super-collection with a laconic title Alter tractatus, which includes additional Isidorean interrogationes and responsiones on winds and water, books and libraries, human and divine laws, and the mass; see Gunter Glauche, Die Pergamenthandschriften aus dem Domkapitel Freising, Bd. 2, Clm 6317-6437 (Wiesbaden, 2011), pp. 155–56. The last item could qualify the super-collection as a text compiled for priests, but it also seems too little to go on. Yet another candidate is a collection surviving in four Italian manuscripts from the tenth and eleventh centuries. Built entirely of excerpts of the Etymologiae, it treats priests, monks, and lay people (Etym. VII 12-14), the Church and Christian religion (Etym. VIII 1-2), and the Church councils (Etym. VI 16). Two of the manuscripts transmitting an extended version add chapters on heresies (Etym. VIII 3-4) and a heresiological treatise compiled from Augustine's De haeresibus and the Indiculus de haeresibus. This collection cannot be shown to be Carolingian and the Indiculus de haeresibus suggest it is an Italian creation; see Ernesto Stagni, "Nell'officina di Paolo Diacono? Prime indagini su Isidoro e Cassiodoro nel Par. lat. 7530," Litterae Caelestes 4 (2012), 9-105, at pp. 19-20. Finally, a large collection in 56 capitula preserved in two ninth-century manuscripts brings together an abridgement of books VI-VIII of the Etymologiae, snippets of books I (history) and XI (the human body), excerpts from Cassiodorus's Expositio psalmorum (on the Psalms), two expositions of the Creed, and a long exposition of the baptismal rite; see Codoñer Merino, "Transmisión y recepción," pp. 15-18. This collection confined to northern Italy perhaps represents a local response to the call for *correctio*. Manuscripts of these three collections are recounted in the second part of the appendix. Into the same category perhaps belongs also the ps-Alcuinian Disputatio puerorum, a collection of interrogationes et responsiones making use of books V-VII and XI of the Etymologiae; see Andrew Rabin and Liam Ethan Felsen, The Disputatio Puerorum: a ninthcentury monastic instructional text, Toronto medieval Latin texts 34 (Toronto, 2017).

be exploited similarly, no other Patristic author appears as frequently in Carolingian instructional collections and manuscripts for priests. ⁹⁷ Carolingian reformers had at their disposal other texts discussing matters relevant to priests' training, including such that were specifically intended for this purpose. ⁹⁸ Some were even recommended or prescribed to be read by priests by normative Carolingian sources. ⁹⁹ Nevertheless, Isidore's encyclopaedia, unmentioned by Carolingian councils and episcopal statutes, held a special place in their designs as a resource for the compilation of catechetic collections. ¹⁰⁰

This was partly due to its utilitarian character, brevity, and simplicity of language, making it the perfect resource to tap for the formation of clerics whose level of Latin may have been limited and previous knowledge of Christian doctrine dubious. However, it is also a testimony to the profound change in how this seventh-century encyclopaedia was read and used in the Carolingian period. We discussed Carolingian collections featuring excerpts from the *Etymologiae* only in light of the Carolingian interest in the instruction of priests. However, we can also turn this inquiry around and ask what *correctio* meant for the medieval reception of Isidore's most important work. Importantly, the texts described here represent but a few of the trees in the largely uncharted forest of Isidorean collections and appropriations compiled with great creativity in the Carolingian environment, starting from the last decades of the eighth

⁹⁷ This was implicitly observed by Keefe, who dedicated a special section to the works of Isidore in her study of Carolingian baptismal instruction; see Keefe, *Water and the Word*, 2:133, and also 1:13.

⁹⁸ Most notably, Isidore can be compared to Gregory the Great, whose *Regula pastoralis* was the ultimate early medieval guidebook for priests, see for example Notker Balbulus's *Notatio de viris illustribus*, in which it is called a *speculum ... in quo omnis homo se ipsum inveniet quasi depictum et precipue episcopi vel presbiteri*; Erwin Rauner, "Notkers des Stammlers Notatio de illustribus uiris," *Mittellateinisches Jahrbuch* 21 (1986), 34–69, at p. 63. Gregory's early medieval popularity is undeniable. However, it can be noted that his works were not excerpted into anonymous catechetic collections in the same fashion as Isidore's *Etymologiae*, but rather more likely to be transmitted as a complete text, such as in the priest's books described in Raymond Étaix, "Un manuel de pastorale de l'époque carolingienne (Clm 27152)," *Revue bénédictine* 91 (1981), 105–30; and Rhijn, "Royal Politics in Small Worlds," pp. 1–2.

⁹⁹ Regula pastoralis and De ecclesiasticis officiis are mentioned as required reading for priests in the priests' exam the Capitula Frisingensia Prima; Rhijn, Leading the Way to Heaven, p. 51. Regula pastoralis is also recommended to priests by Carolingian councils; see Maximilian Diesenberger, Predigt und Politik im frühmittelalterlichen Bayern: Arn von Salzburg, Karl der Groβe und die Salzburger Sermones-Sammlung, Millennium-Studien 58 (Berlin, 2015), pp. 160–61.

¹⁰⁰ Isidore's prominent role in the Carolingian correctio is also noted in Fontaine, "La Figure d'Isidore de Séville," p. 179.

century. Among them are not only catechetic collections but a whole range of instructional and didactic compilations, many in the question-and-answer format. ¹⁰¹ They provide essential evidence that under the influence of the spirit of reform, the *Etymologiae* began to be utilised in the Frankish lands as a pedagogical text. ¹⁰² Crucially, in this capacity, it penetrated even the lower levels of instruction. Remedial training of semi-literate priests was certainly not the purpose guiding Isidore's encyclopaedic compilation in the seventh century. Indeed, some of the early medieval manuscript evidence suggests that in Carolingian Italy and the German area, the *Etymologiae* may have continued to be read primarily as a scholarly text. ¹⁰³ The penetration of the material from the *Etymologiae* into an instructional setting also took place here; however, it seems to have been limited, late, and perhaps should be considered an influence from the Frankish lands. If we observed that the four catechetic collections analysed in this paper originated in the *scriptoria* of northern France, it is because most of the Isidorean compilations from the Carolingian period come from this region. ¹⁰⁴

¹⁰¹ The more well-known examples include the *ars Isidori*, the self-standing book I of the *Etymologiae* used as a grammatical handbook, and the legalistic *interrogationes et responsiones De legibus divinis et humanis*; see Evina Steinová, "The Early Reception History of the First Book of the Etymologies as a Mirror of Carolingian Intellectual Networks: A Proposal," in *Social and Intellectual Networking in the Early Middle Ages*, ed. Michael Kelly and Patrick Fazioli (New York, 2022), forthcoming; and Tardif, "Un abrégé juridique". Other compilations based on the *Etymologiae* are described in Codoñer Merino, "Transmisión y recepción"; and Cardelle de Hartmann, "Uso y recepción". Many can be also found in the *Innovating Knowledge* database mapping the early medieval transmission of Isidore's encyclopaedia, at: https://db.innovatingknowledge.nl/ (accessed on 28/02/2022).

102 Compare with Contreni, "The Carolingian Renaissance," p. 726; and John J. Contreni, "The Pursuit of Knowledge in Carolingian Renaissance," p. 726; and John J. Contreni, "The Pursuit of Knowledge in Carolingian Renaissance," p. 726; and John J. Contreni, "The Pursuit of Knowledge in Carolingian Renaissance," p. 726; and John J. Contreni, "The Pursuit of Knowledge in Carolingian Renaissance," p. 726; and John J. Contreni, "The Pursuit of Knowledge in Carolingian Renaissance," p. 726; and John J. Contreni, "The Pursuit of Knowledge in Carolingian Renaissance," p. 726; and John J. Contreni, "The Pursuit of Knowledge in Carolingian Renaissance," p. 726; and John J. Contreni, "The Pursuit of Knowledge in Carolingian Renaissance," p. 726; and John J. Contreni, "The Pursuit of Knowledge in Carolingian Renaissance," p. 726; and John J. Contreni, "The Pursuit of Knowledge in Carolingian Renaissance," p. 726; and John J. Contreni, "The Pursuit of Knowledge on Carolingian Renaissance," p. 726; and John J. Contreni, "The Pursuit of Knowledge on Carolingian Renaissance," p. 726; and John J. Contreni, "

¹⁰² Compare with Contreni, "The Carolingian Renaissance," p. 726; and John J. Contreni, "The Pursuit of Knowledge in Carolingian Europe," in *The Gentle Voices of Teachers: Aspects of Learning in the Carolingian Age*, ed. Richard Sullivan (Columbus, OH, 1995), pp. 106–41, at 117.

¹⁰³ It can be, for example, observed that while annotations to the text of the *Etymologiae* originating in northern France have the form of school glosses and appear predominantly in manuscripts transmitting the first book of the *Etymologiae* as an *ars grammatica*, in northern Italy and in the German area, annotations appear almost exclusively in the large encyclopedic codices of the *Etymologiae* and have a notably scholarly tone; Evina Steinová, "Annotation of the *Etymologiae* of Isidore of Seville in Its Early Medieval Context," *Archivum Latinitatis Medii Aevi* 78 (2020), 5–81. Also, several redactions of the *Etymologiae* came into being in the early Middle Ages in northern Italy, the German area, and northern Spain, but none in northern France; see Evina Steinová, "Two Carolingian Redactions of the *Etymologiae* from St. Gallen," *Mittellateinisches Jahrbuch* 56 (2021), 298–376, at pp. 347–49.

¹⁰⁴ The collection *De legibus divinis et humanis*, for example, was compiled, according to its editor, in northern France; Tardif, "Un abrégé juridique," p. 669. The *ars Isidori*, albeit surviving in a few manuscripts that come from the German area, is principally a northern French phenomenon; Steinová, "The Early Reception History of the First Book of the Etymologies.' Note, however, that the same can be said about manuscripts identified as handbooks for priests; Rhijn, *Leading the Way to Heaven*, p. 81. We may be, thus, also looking at the artifact of the uneven survival of manuscripts and texts. The question of the potential regionality of the use of the *Etymologiae* for didactic purposes should be investigated further.

The prominent place that the *Etymologiae* occupies in Carolingian catechetic collections can be seen as an outcome of a collision between this useful text, which enjoyed substantial popularity already in pre-Carolingian times, ¹⁰⁵ and *correctio*, that required ready-made resources that could be easily seized for its goals. ¹⁰⁶ This collision resulted in many instances in the appropriation of Isidore's text. Crucially, the stronger the traces this collision left in the evidence from the early Middle Ages in the form of the number of known compilations with a specific theme or focus using the *Etymologiae* and the number of surviving witnesses, the more central we can assume was a particular interest of the reformers. In this respect, we can observe that the compilations described in this paper, together with Isidorean grammatical collections, represent the most prominent outcome of the metaphorical collision. ¹⁰⁷ We should not be surprised: the instruction of the clergy and the establishment of schools where grammar was one of the principal disciplines were the two most prominent objectives of *correctio*.

The recasting of the *Etymologiae* as a pedagogical resource may be considered one of the farreaching legacies of the Carolingian reforms. As a result of this transformation, Isidore's text
trickled down to a much broader audience than it could reach if it remained confined to the pages
of the voluminous encyclopaedic codices. Importantly, such repurposing of Isidore's
encyclopaedia had a self-reinforcing effect. The more often it became excerpted into manuscripts
for instruction and practical use, the more this text would have been perceived as pedagogical in
character and therefore used as such. In the end, we should be keenly aware that when the *Etymologiae* was cited or referenced in the Carolingian period, it was mostly not because of the

_

¹⁰⁵ For the didactic use of the *Etymologiae*, it is particularly important that it had earlier precursors in the domain of teaching *computus* in the insular world; see Immo Warntjes, "Isidore of Seville and the Formation of Medieval Computus," in *A Companion to Isidore of Seville*, ed. Andrew Fear and Jamie Wood (Leiden - Boston, 2020), pp. 457–523.

¹⁰⁶ Compare with Fontaine, "La Figure d'Isidore de Séville," p. 183.

¹⁰⁷ See Steinová, "The Oldest Manuscript Tradition of the *Etymologiae*," p. 132.

familiarity with the encyclopaedic text but via the medium of various lower-grade manuscripts containing excerpts and appropriations of this work. The ubiquity of the *Etymologiae* in the Carolingian intellectual landscape is a profound testimony not only to Isidore's authority but also to the training Carolingian intellectuals received in their earlier life. Like Aurelian, they perhaps received their first dose of Isidore from handbooks such as **St. Gall 879** during their clerical training.

Appendix: early medieval catechetic collections containing substantial material from the Etymologiae

- A. Collections with a clear catechetic tone surviving in multiple manuscripts
- 1. De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris et de baptismatis officio

Einsiedeln, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 110 (saec. XI², St. Gall): pp. 87-114, long version

<u>Fulda, Hochschul- und Landesbibliothek, MS Aa 2</u> (saec. X, Bodensee area): fols. 15r-17v, long version, lacks section 8

Milan, Biblioteca Ambrosiana, MS H 48 sup. (saec. XII, Italy): fols. 153r-164r

Naples, Biblioteca Nazionale Vittorio Emanuele III, MS VI.E.41 (saec. XII, Italy): long version, Italian group

Olomouc, Zemský archív, MS Kap. Bibl. 135 (unknown, Italy): long version, Italian group

Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Holkham Misc. 17 (saec. XII^{in.}, central Italy): fols. 19r-25r, long version, Italian group

Sélestat, Bibliothèque humaniste, MS 132 (saec. IX^{med.}, Mainz): fols. 24r-28v, short version¹⁰⁸

St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 446 (saec. IX^{3/4}, St. Gall): pp. 79-105, long version

St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 777 (saec. XII, St. Gall [?]): p. 3, only sections 1, 5-6

<u>Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Pal. Lat. 485</u> (saec. IX^{3/4}, Lorsch): fols. 46v-48r, short version

<u>Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Vat. Lat. 1146</u> (saec. XI, Italy): fols. 19r-25r, long version, Italian group

Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Vat. Lat. 1147 (saec. XI², Polirone): long version, Italian group

<u>Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Vat. Lat. 1148</u> (saec. XI, central Italy): fols. XXv-XXVIv, long version, Italian group

<u>Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, MS 914</u> (saec. XI², central Italy): fols. 12v-21r, long version, Italian group

2. Collectio unde

- Albi, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 39 (saec. IX^{1/4}, southern France, prov.: Albi): fols. 112r-115v, 74-question version, lacks items 1-37 due to the loss of folia
- Bern, Burgerbibliothek, MS 225 (fols. 88-103) + Orléans, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 313 (saec. IX^{1/4}, western France): pp. 195-204, 74-question version
- Cologne, Dombibliothek, MS 85 (saec. X, unknown): fols. 96v-103r, 74-question version
- <u>Leiden, Universiteitsbibliotheek, MS Voss. Lat. Q 122</u> (fols. 89-96) (saec. IX^{3/4}, western France [?]): 74-question version¹⁰⁹
- Montecassino, Archivio dell'Abbazia, MS 29 (saec. X/XI, central Italy): pp. 112-128, 162question version
- New York, Columbia University, MS Plimpton 58 (saec. IX^{2/3}, southern France): fols. 95r-101v, 74-question version
- Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS Lat. 614A (saec. X, southern France): fols. 166r-172r, 74-question version
- Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS Lat. 1205 (fol. II) (saec. IX^{1/3}, France): a fragment, contains items 60-69
- Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS Lat. 2175 (saec. IX^{in.}, southwestern Germany): fols. 96v-100r, 74-question version
- Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS Lat. 10612 (saec. IX¹, Tours): fols. 100r-106v, 74question version
- <u>Troyes, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 1433</u> (saec. XII², prov.: Clairvaux): fols. 56v-57v, 16 questions from the 162-question version
- <u>Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Reg. Lat. 1587</u> (fols. 51-56) (saec. IX^{3/4}, western France, prov.: Fleury): fols. 51r-53r, an abridgement of the 74-question version¹¹⁰

3. Pauca de fide catholica et de officiis ecclesiasticis

<u>Leipzig, Universitätsbibliothek, MS 225</u> (fols. 1-160) (saec. XII, prov.: Altzelle by Nossen): fols. 160r-160v, lacks items 11-17 (distorted order)

<u>London, British Library, MS Royal 8 C III</u> (saec. X^{4/4}, southeastern England): fols. 54r-58v (distorted order)

Montpellier, Bibliothèque interuniversitaire, MS H 387 (saec. IX^{3/4}, northern France [?]): fols. 50r-57r, item 3 before items 1-2 (authentic order)

Monza, Biblioteca capitolare, MS e-14/127 (saec. IX^{3/4}, northern Italy): fols. 70v-72v (distorted order)

Wolfenbüttel, Herzog August Bibliothek, MS Helmst. 532 (ca. 820, Salzburg): fols. 91v-93r, lacks items 15-17 (distorted order)

4. The question-and-answer sections of the Collectio Sangermanensis

Albi, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 38 (saec. X¹, Albi): fols. 38v-42r, the beginning of section 1 (only the *interrogationes et responsiones*)

Albi, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 38bis (ca. 813 [?], southern France, prov.: Albi): fols. 126v-127r + 127v, sections 1-9 (only the *interrogationes et responsiones*)¹¹¹

Cologne, Dombibliothek, MS 117 (saec. IX^{3/4}, France): fols. 69r-89r, sections 1-20

<u>London, British Library, MS Harley 3034</u> (saec. IX^{1/4} [?], Rhine area, perhaps Lorsch or the area of Mainz): fols. 1r-10r, sections 12-16 (only the *interrogationes et responsiones*)¹¹²

Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, MS Clm 14508 (saec. IX^{3/4}, north-eastern France): fols. 75r-105v, sections 12-19

Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS Lat. 12444 (saec. VIII/IX, Fleury [?], prov.: Corbie): fols. 1r-104v, a complete witness

<u>Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Pal. Lat. 485</u> (saec. IX^{3/4}, Lorsch): fols. 44v-45r, a part of section 12 (only the *interrogationes et responsiones*)

Vesoul, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 79 (saec. XI, France): fols. 81r-83v, sections 1-3, 6, 8-10, 12, 16, and 19

- B. Collections that may have been intended for or used by priests surviving in multiple manuscripts
- 5. Interrogationes et responsiones de diversis causis

¹¹¹ Minor differences in section 8

¹¹² Instead of *INT* and *R*, uses *D* and *M* for *discipulus* and *magister*.

Berlin, Staatsbibliothek, MS Theol. Lat. fol. 610 (saec. $XV^{3/4}$, central Germany, Leipzig): fols. 253v-372v

Cambridge, Trinity College, O.2.30 (saec. XI/XII, England): fols. 4r-17r

Leipzig, Universitätsbibliotheek, MS 255 (saec. XII/XIII): fols. 138r-147v

London, British Library, MS Royal 5 E xvi (saec. XI, Salisbury): fols. 1r-19v

Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, MS Clm 6382 (saec. IX², area of Reims [?]): fols. 23v-35v

Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS Lat. 561 (saec. XIII): fols. 56v-65v

<u>Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS Lat. 2024</u> (before 875, northern France): fols. 20v-42v, incomplete due to a loss of folia

Rome, Biblioteca Angelica, MS 70 (saec. XIII)

6. An anonymous Italian collection of excerpts from Etym. VI, VII and VIII

Montecassino, Archivio dell'Abbazia, MS 205 (saec. XI, unknown): pp. 139-168, long version Montecassino, Archivio dell'Abbazia, MS 384 (pp. 113-172) (saec. X^{in.}, Monte Cassino): pp. 125-133, short version

<u>Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Barb. Lat. 587</u> (1060-1070, Rome): fols. 307r-307v, short version

<u>Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Vat. Lat. 1469</u> (saec. X/XI, central Italy): fols. 276v-291r, long version

7. An Italian epitome of *Etym*. VI-VIII

Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Vat. Lat. 5764 (saec. IX^{1/4}, Verona): fols. 1r-70r

Zürich, Zentralbibliothek, MS Car. C 102 (fols. 33-59) (saec. IX^{3/4}, northern Italy): fols. 33r-55r

C. Collections with a catechetic tone surviving in singular manuscripts

St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 230 (ca. 800, St. Gall): pp. 93-118¹¹³

Karlsruhe, Badische Landesbibliothek, MS Aug. Perg. 18 (ca. 806, Reichenau): pp. 133-148¹¹⁴

Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS Lat. 18104 (saec. IX^{2/4}, Tours): fols. 53r-71v¹¹⁵

Orléans, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 116 (saec. IX^{2-3/3}, western France): fols. 72r-85r¹¹⁶

Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Pal. Lat. 485 (saec. IX^{3/4}, Lorsch): fols. 16r- $17r^{117}$

Florence, Biblioteca Laurenziana, MS Conv.Soppr. B.II.406 (saec. XI): fols. 55r-60v and 107v- $127v^{118}$

¹¹³ A collection of pure Isidorean excerpts with the title as Liber sancti Hisidori episcopi treating God, Christ, the Holy Spirit, the Trinity, and angels (Etym. VII 1-5), apostles and Virgin Mary (Etym. VII 9-10.1), priests, monks, and lay people (Etym. VII 12-14), and liturgical chant (Etvm. VI 19.13-21).

¹¹⁴ A collection of excerpts from the Etymologiae on God, Christ, the Holy Spirit and the Trinity (Etym. VII 1-4), the Church, doctrine, and heresy (Etym. VIII 1-5); priests, monks, and lay people (Etym. VII 12-14); and baptism, the mass, the sacraments, and other Christian rites (Etym. VI 19) combined with an exposition of the Creed and a selection of canons dealing with heresy.

¹¹⁵ A collection that combines sections of the Etymologiae on God, Christ, the Holy Spirit, and the Trinity (Etym. VII 1-4), baptism (Etym. VI 19.43-47), catechumens (Etym. VII 14.7) and the Creed (Etym. VI 19.57-58) with Alcuin's letter to Oduin we saw in De catholica ecclesia et eius ministris (as De mysteriis sacris baptismatis pauca incipiunt), and several anonymous expositions of the Creed and the baptismal rite.

¹¹⁶ An acephalous collection that discusses the origin of priesthood, the mass, prayer, the virginal birth, the Flood, books, writing, and the Gospels, Christ as the Son of David and Son of Abraham, the origin of letters, baptism, the Creed, and the Church and Church councils making use of Etym. VI 16 (De canonibus conciliorum), VI 19 (De officiis), and VIII 1 (De ecclesia et synagoga), as well as one excerpt each from Isidore's De officiis (on priests) and Bede's De temporum ratione (for Church councils). The pages of this manuscript measure only 190 x 135 mm, suggesting that it is another personal notebook.

117 A sequence of definitions of terms relevant to the priestly office drawn from books VI-VIII of the *Etymologiae*.

¹¹⁸ Two collections featuring material from the Etymologiae, De officiis, and Sententiae. The self-standing chapters De Deo, De filio Dei, De spiritu sancto, and De trinitate (Etym. VII 1-4) appear on fols. 86v-88v; see manus.iccu.sbn.it/cnmd/0000206196 (accessed on 28/02/2022).